2E 2H 2F 2T 2G 2K 2M 2L 2N 2P

20 IST CD

3

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

20 NONE

AND

CLERK US DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF ARIZONA DEPUTY

INDIAN BEND WASH NORTH

SFUND RECORDS CTR
2230166

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

Plaintiff,

VS.

MOTOROLA INC., SIEMENS CORPORA-TION, SALT RIVER VALLEY WATER USERS' ASSOCIATION, SALT RIVER PROJECT AGRICULTURAL IMPROVEMENT & POWER DISTRICT, SMITHKLINE BEECHAM CORPORATION, CITY OF SCOTTSDALE, L.D. HANCOCK, & ELAINE HANCOCK, THE HIGHSMITH COMPANY, MICROSEMI CORP--SCOTTSDALE, P.A.G.E.--LAYHER, and SCOTTSDALE MEMORIAL HOSPITAL,

Defendants.

No. CIV 92-2314 PHX PGR

ORDER GRANTING MOTION FOR ENTRY OF CONSENT DECREE

This Court has reviewed the proposed consent decree, the motion and supporting materials for entry of the decree, the comments and the United States' responses thereto, and any other materials submitted with respect to this matter. After consideration, the Court finds that the proposed consent decree is fair, reasonable, and consistent with the purposes of CERCLA.

26 A0(72)

(B)

THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the United States' Motion for Entry of Consent Decree (Doc. 13) is granted, and the proposed Consent Decree, lodged with this Court on December 11, 1992, is entered as an Order of this Court.

DATED this 5 day of 4vc., 1993.

Hon. Paul G. Rosenblatt United States District Judge

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	I.	BACKGROUND
	II.	JURISDICTION
	III.	PARTIES BOUND
	IV.	<u>DEFINITIONS</u>
	<b>v.</b>	GENERAL PROVISIONS
	VI.	PERFORMANCE OF THE JOINT AND VADOSE ZONE WORK BY SETTLING DEFENDANTS
	VII.	ADDITIONAL RESPONSE ACTIONS
	VIII.	EPA PERIODIC REVIEW
	IX.	QUALITY ASSURANCE, SAMPLING, and DATA ANALYSIS 22
	<b>x.</b>	<u>ACCESS</u>
	XI.	REPORTING REQUIREMENTS
	XII.	SUBMISSIONS REQUIRING AGENCY APPROVAL
	XIII.	PROJECT COORDINATORS
	xIV.	ASSURANCE OF ABILITY TO COMPLETE WORK
	xv.	CERTIFICATION OF COMPLETION
	XVI.	EMERGENCY RESPONSE
-	XVII.	REIMBURSEMENT OF RESPONSE COSTS
	XVIII.	INDEMNIFICATION AND INSURANCE 45
	XIX.	FORCE MAJEURE
	xx.	DISPUTE RESOLUTION
	xxI.	STIPULATED PENALTIES
	XXII.	COVENANTS NOT TO SUE BY PLAINTIFF 60
	xxIII.	COVENANTS BY DEFENDANTS 67
	xxiv.	EFFECT OF SETTLEMENT; CONTRIBUTION PROTECTION 68
	xxv.	ACCESS TO INFORMATION

XXVI.	RETENTION OF RECORDS		
xxvii.	NOTICES AND SUBMISSIONS		
xxviii.	<u>EFFECTIVE DATE</u>		
XXIX.	RETENTION OF JURISDICTION		
xxx.	<u>APPENDICES</u>		
xxxI.	COMMUNITY RELATIONS		
xxxII.	<u>MODIFICATION</u>		
XXXIII. LODGING AND OPPORTUNITY FOR PUBLIC COMMENT			
XXXIV.	SIGNATORIES/SERVICE		
APPENDICES:			
APPENDIX A - ROD.			
<u><b>AP</b></u>	APPENDIX B.2-B.3, B.5-B.10 - Statements of Work (SOWs) for the Vadose Zone Work.		
AP	PENDIX B.11- Statements of Work (SOWs) for the Joint Remedial Action.		
<u>AP</u>	PENDIX C - Map of the Site.		
<u>AP</u>	PENDIX D - Attachment II to EPA's Special Notice Letter dated September 30, 1991.		

<u>APPENDIX E</u> - List of Supervising Contractors for Settling Defendants.

\_\_\_

- A. The United States of America ("United States"), on behalf of the Administrator of the United States Environmental Protection Agency ("EPA"), filed a complaint in this matter pursuant to Sections 106 and 107 of the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act ("CERCLA"), 42 U.S.C. §§ 9606, 9607.
- B. The United States in its complaint seeks, inter alia:

  (1) reimbursement of costs incurred by EPA and the Department of

  Justice for response actions at the northern portion of the

  Indian Bend Wash Superfund Site ("NIBW") in Scottsdale and Tempe,

  Arizona, together with accrued interest; and (2) performance of

  response actions by the Defendants at the Site consistent with

  the National Contingency Plan, 40 C.F.R. Part 300 (as amended)

  ("NCP").
- C. The Defendants that have entered into this Consent Decree ("Settling Defendants" and "Cash Defendants") do not admit any of the averments in the complaint and do not admit any liability to the Plaintiff or any other person arising out of the transactions or occurrences alleged in the complaint.
- D. Pursuant to Section 105 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9605, EPA placed the Site on the National Priorities List, set forth at 40 C.F.R. Part 300, Appendix B, by publication in the Federal Register on September 8, 1983, 48 Fed. Reg. 40658;
- E. On June 1, 1984, EPA commenced a Remedial Investigation and Feasibility Study ("RI/FS") for the Site in response to a

release or a substantial threat of a release of hazardous substances at or from the Site, pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 300.430;

- F. A previous Consent Decree, Civil Action No. 91-1835, was executed by the United States, the State, the City of Scottsdale, and the Settling Defendants for the Joint Work, and was entered by the Court on April 28, 1992, for the Scottsdale Operable Unit (referred to as the "Scottsdale Operable Unit Consent Decree" or "SOUCD"). Under the SOUCD, the Settling Defendants for the Joint Work will, inter alia, finance the design, construction and operation of a groundwater treatment plant to treat groundwater from the Middle Alluvial Unit ("MAU") and the Lower Alluvial Unit ("LAU") at the NIBW. Upon completion of construction, the treatment plant will be transferred to the City of Scottsdale, which will operate the treatment plant. The SOUCD also requires, inter alia, groundwater monitoring of the MAU and LAU.
- Pursuant to Section 117 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9617, EPA published notices of the completion of the RI/FS and of the proposed plan for remedial action on April 10 and on April 14, 1991, in major local newspapers of general circulation. EPA provided an opportunity for written and oral comments from the public on the proposed plan for remedial action. A copy of the transcript of the public meeting is available to the public as part of the administrative record upon which the Regional Administrator based the selection of the response action.
- The decision by EPA on the remedial action to be implemented at the Site is embodied in a final Record of Decision ("ROD"), executed on September 12, 1991, on which the State has 28 given its concurrence. The ROD includes EPA's explanation for

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

- any significant differences between the final plan and the proposed plan as well as a responsiveness summary to the public comments. Notice of the final plan was published in accordance with Section 117(b) of CERCLA.
- I. Based on the information presently available to EPA, EPA believes that the Joint and Vadose Zone Work will be properly and promptly conducted by the Settling Defendants if conducted in accordance with the requirements of this Consent Decree, including its appendices.
- J. Solely for the purposes of Section 113(j) of CERCLA, the remedial actions selected by the ROD and the Joint and Vadose Zone Work to be performed by the Settling Defendants shall constitute a response action taken or ordered by the President.
- K. The Parties recognize, and the Court by entering this
  Consent Decree finds, that this Consent Decree has been
  negotiated by the Parties in good faith and implementation of
  this Consent Decree will expedite the cleanup of the Site and
  will avoid prolonged and remplicated litigation between the
  Parties, and that this Consent Decree is fair, reasonable, and in
  the public interest.

NOW, THEREFORE, it is hereby Ordered, Adjudged, and Decreed:

# II. JURISDICTION

1. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this action pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331 and 1345, and 42 U.S.C. §§ 9606, 9607, and 9613(b). This Court also has personal jurisdiction over the Defendants. Solely for the purposes of this Consent Decree and the underlying complaint, Defendants waive all objections and defenses that they may have to

jurisdiction of the Court or to venue in this District.

Defendants shall not challenge the terms of this Consent Decree

or this Court's jurisdiction to enter and enforce this Consent

Decree.

#### III. PARTIES BOUND

- 2. This Consent Decree applies to and is binding upon the United States and upon Defendants and their successors and assigns. Any change in ownership or corporate status of a Defendant including, but not limited to, any transfer of assets or real or personal property shall in no way alter such Defendant's responsibilities under this Consent Decree.
- Settling Defendants shall provide a copy of this Consent Decree to each contractor hired to perform the Joint and/or Vadose Zone Work (as defined below) required by this Consent Decree and to each person representing any Settling Defendant with respect to the Site or the Joint and/or Vadose Zone Work and shall condition all contracts entered into hereunder upon performance of the Joint and/or Vadose Zone Work in conformity with the terms of this Consent Decree. Settling Defendants or their contractors shall provide written notice of the Consent Decree to all subcontractors hired to perform any portion of the Joint and/or Vadose Zone Work required by this Consent Decree. Settling Defendants shall nonetheless be responsible for ensuring that their contractors and subcontractors perform the Joint and/or Vadose Zone Work contemplated herein in accordance with this Consent Decree. With regard to the activities undertaken pursuant to this Consent Decree, each contractor and subcontractor shall be deemed to be in a contractual relationship

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

with the appropriate Settling Defendants within the meaning of Section 107(b)(3) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9607(b)(3).

## IV. <u>DEFINITIONS</u>

4. Unless otherwise expressly provided herein, terms used in this Consent Decree which are defined in CERCLA or in regulations promulgated under CERCLA shall have the meaning assigned to them in CERCLA or in such regulations. Whenever terms listed below are used in this Consent Decree, including the appendices attached hereto and incorporated hereunder, the following—

definitions shall apply:

"Cash Defendants" shall mean, with reference to contributions toward the Settling Defendants' payments of Past and Future Response Costs and obligations pursuant to Sections XXVI (Record Retention), X (Access), and XXI (Stipulated Penalties) of this Consent Decree: L.D. Hancock Company and L.D. Hancock and Elaine Hancock individually; The Highsmith Company, Inc. (for itself, Rolamech Patents, Inc., Handy Company, Inc., Rolamech Company, Rolamech Inc., Rolamech Company, Inc., and W & J Investments)

(collectively "Rolamech"); Microsemi Corp. - Scottsdale, an Arizona corporation (for itself and its parent corporation, Microsemi Corporation); P.A.G.E.-Layher; and Scottsdale Memorial Hospital (for itself and Scottsdale Memorial Realty Company).

"CERCLA" shall mean the Comprehensive Environmental Response,

"CERCLA" shall mean the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act of 1980, as amended, 42 U.S.C. \$§ 9601 et seq.

"Consent Decree" shall mean this Decree and all appendices attached hereto (listed in Section XXX). In the event of

conflict between this Decree and any appendix, this Decree shall control.

"Day" shall mean a calendar day unless expressly stated to be a working day. "Working day" shall mean a day other than a Saturday, Sunday, or Federal holiday. In computing any period of time under this Consent Decree, where the last day would fall on a Saturday, Sunday, or Federal holiday, the period shall run until the close of business of the next working day.

"Defendants" shall mean "Settling Defendants" and "Cash Defendants".

"EPA" shall mean the United States Environmental Protection Agency and any successor departments or agencies of the United States.

"Future Response Costs" shall mean all costs, including, but not limited to, direct and indirect costs, that the United States incurs in reviewing or developing plans, reports and other items pursuant to this Consent Decree, verifying the Joint and/or Vadose Zone Work, or otherwise implementing, overseeing, or enforcing this Consent Decree, including, but not limited to, payroll costs, contractor costs, travel costs, laboratory costs, the costs incurred pursuant to Sections VII, VIII, X (including, but not limited to, attorneys fees and the amount of just compensation), XVI, and Paragraph 81 of Section XXII. Future Response Costs shall also include all costs, including direct and indirect costs, paid by the United States in connection with the Site between April 30, 1991 and the effective date of this Consent Decree, except for EPA payroll costs, which shall be calculated from April 20, 1991 to the effective date of this

Consent Decree, and except for DOJ costs, which shall be calculated from September 1, 1991 to the effective date of this Consent Decree, and all interest on the Past Response Costs from September 30, 1991, as appropriate to the date of payment of the Past Response Costs.

"Joint Remedial Action" shall mean that portion of the Joint Work, except for Operation and Maintenance, to be undertaken by the Settling Defendants to meet Performance Standards in accordance with Appendix B.11 for the UAU groundwater remedy selected in the ROD.

"Joint Work" shall mean all activities Settling Defendants are required to perform under this Consent Decree, except those required by Section XXVI (Retention of Records) or pertaining solely to Vadose Zone Work.

"National Contingency Plan" or "NCP" shall mean the National Oil and Hazardous Substances Pollution Contingency Plan promulgated pursuant to Section 105 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9605, codified at 40 C.F.R. Part 300, including, but not limited to, any amendments thereto.

"Operation and Maintenance" or "O & M" shall mean all activities required to maintain the effectiveness of the Joint Remedial Action as identified by the Operation and Maintenance requirements approved or developed by EPA pursuant to this Consent Decree.

"Owner Defendants" shall mean the City of Scottsdale, L.D.

Hancock, Motorola Inc., The Highsmith Company, Inc. (on behalf of Rolamech), P.A.G.E.-Layher, Scottsdale Memorial Hospital, and Salt River Project Agricultural Improvement and Power District.

15.

"Paragraph" shall mean a portion of this Consent Decree identified by an arabic numeral or an upper case letter.

"Parties" shall mean the United States and the Defendants.

"Past Response Costs" shall mean all costs, including, but not limited to, direct and indirect costs and interest, that the United States incurred with regard to the Site prior to September 1, 1991 for DOJ costs, to April 20, 1991 for EPA payroll costs and to April 30, 1991 for all other costs, except for interest, which shall be calculated from September 30, 1991.

"Performance Standards" shall mean those cleanup standards, standards of control, and other substantive requirements, criteria or limitations set forth in Appendix A of the ROD and in the applicable SOW. In particular, the Performance Standards for groundwater shall include, but are not limited to, the chemical specific standards selected in Appendix A of the ROD except for the in situ chemical specific standard for any substance which EPA determines in accordance with § 104(a)(3)(A) of CERCLA is a naturally occurring substance in its unaltered form or altered solely through naturally occurring processes or phenomena, from a location where it is naturally found. Performance Standards shall also mean 1) the significant and continuous reduction of the mass of volatile organic compounds ("VOCs") in the Upper Alluvial Unit ("UAU") due to migration to the MAU and/or the LAU and 2) that VOCs do not migrate to uncontaminated areas in the UAU, MAU, or LAU. The Performance Standards for the vadose zone include, but are not limited to, a demonstration that the mass of all VOCs in the vadose zone for a specific area will not cause VOC concentrations in the groundwater to exceed those chemical-

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

-9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

specific standards set forth in Appendix A of the ROD. demonstrations shall be made by application of the VLEACH model (or an EPA-approved equivalent) and mixing zone calculations, in accordance with Appendices B.2-3, B.5-B.10. Parameters for the VLEACH model and for the mixing zone calculations shall be subject to approval by EPA.

"Plaintiff" shall mean the United States.

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

"RCRA" shall mean the Solid Waste Disposal Act, as amended, 42 U.S.C. \$5 6901 et seq. (also known as the Resource Conservation and Recovery Act).

\*Record of Decision\* or \*ROD\* shall mean the EPA Record of Decision relating to the UAU groundwater and vadose zone remedial actions at the Site signed on September 12, 1991, by the Regional Administrator, EPA Region IX.

"Remedial Design" shall mean those activities to be undertaken by the Settling Defendants to develop the final plans and specifications for the Joint Remedial Action and Vadose Zone Work, pursuant to Appendices B.2-B.3, B.5-B.11.

"Scottsdale Operable Unit Consent Decree" or "SOUCD" shall mean the Consent Decree, Civil Action No. 91-1835-PHX, which was entered in the United States District Court for the District of Arizona on April 28, 1992 and which sets forth, inter alia, the response actions required to implement the remedial action for the MAU and LAU at the Site.

"Section" shall mean a portion of this Consent Decree identified by a roman numeral.

"Settling Defendants" shall mean: (i) with reference to those 28 provisions of this Consent Decree relating to Joint Work and the

reimbursement of Past Response Costs, Motorola Inc., Salt River . 1 2 Project Agricultural Improvement and Power District and Salt 3 River Valley Water Users' Association ("Salt River Project"), Siemens Corporation, and SmithKline Beecham Corporation (on 4 behalf of itself and Beckman Instruments, Inc.); and (ii) with 5 reference to those provisions of this Consent Decree relating to 6 7 area-specific Vadose Zone Work: 8 Area 5A Area 5B 9 Siemens Corporation Salt River Project 10 Area 6 Area 7 11 Siemens Corporation City of Scottsdale 12 Area 8 Siemens Corporation 13 Siemens Corporation Area 9 14 Area 11 Salt River Project 15 Motorola Inc. Area 12 16 Siemens Corporation Motorola Inc. "Site" or "NIBW" shall mean the northern portion of the Indian 17 Bend Wash Superfund Site, bounded approximately by Chaparral Road 18 to the north, by Scottsdale Road to the west, by Pima Road to the 19 East, and to the south by the southern edges of Sections 11 and 20 21 12, Township 1 North, Range 4 East, in Scottsdale and Tempe, Maricopa County, Arizona, including the stratigraphic units 22 designated as the UAU, MAU and LAU. The Site is depicted 23 generally on the map attached as Appendix C. Site shall include 24 any area defined as "on-site" in the NCP. 25 "State" shall mean the Arizona Department of Environmental 26 27 Quality and the Arizona Department of Water Resources.

"Statements of Work" or "SOWs" shall mean the appropriate statements of work for implementation of Remedial Design, Joint Remedial Action, Vadose Zone Work and Operation and Maintenance at the Site, as set forth in Appendices B.2-B.3, B.5-B.11 to this Consent Decree and any modifications made in accordance with this Consent Decree.

"Supervising Contractor(s)" shall mean the principal contractor(s) designated by the Settling Defendants to supervise and direct the implementation of the Joint Work and of the areaspecific Vadose Zone Work under this Consent Decree. For purposes of this Consent Decree, "contractor" includes any "person" so designated, as "person" is defined in Section 101(21) of CERCLA.

"United States" shall mean the United States of America.

"Vadose Zone Work" shall mean all activities to be undertaken

by the Settling Defendants in accordance with Appendices B.2-B.3, B.5-B.10, including meeting Performance Standards, for the vadose zone remedies selected in the ROD, and all other activities

Settling Defendants are required to perform under this Consent Decree, except those required by Section XXVI (Retention of Records) or pertaining solely to Joint Work.

"Waste Material" shall mean (1) any "hazardous substance" under Section 101(14) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9601(14); (2) any pollutant or contaminant under Section 101(33), 42 U.S.C. § 9601(33); (3) and any "solid waste" under Section 1004(27) of RCRA, 42 U.S.C. § 6903(27).

#### V. GENERAL PROVISIONS

## 5. Objectives of the Parties

The objectives of the Parties in entering into this Consent

Decree are to protect public health or welfare or the environment

at the Site by the design and implementation of response actions

at the Site by the Settling Defendants and to reimburse response

costs of the Plaintiff and to resolve past and future claims

against Defendants as set forth in Section XXII (Covenants Not To

Sue by Plaintiff).

#### 6. Commitments by Defendants

- a. Cash Defendants, shall make payments to one or more Settling Defendants in contribution to Settling Defendants' payment of Past and Future Response Costs and/or for performance of Joint Work or Vadose Zone Work, and are subject to all provisions and requirements of this Consent Decree which reference Defendants, and to those provisions and requirements which reference Cash Defendants, including Paragraph 26 of Section X (Access); Section XXVI (Retention of Records); Subparagraph 68.e of Section XXI (Stipulated Penalties); Subparagraph 50.b of Section XVII (Reimbursement of Response Costs); and Section XXII (Covenant Not to Sue by Plaintiff).
- b. Settling Defendants shall finance and perform the Joint and Vadose Zone Work and Record Retention provisions of Section XXVI in accordance with this Consent Decree and all plans, standards, specifications, and schedules set forth in or developed and approved by EPA pursuant to this Consent Decree. Settling Defendants shall also reimburse the United States for

Past Response Costs and Future Response Costs as provided in this Consent Decree.

The obligations of Settling Defendants to finance and perform the Joint Work, to pay Past and Future Response Costs and to pay any penalties and Future Response Costs related to the Joint Work owed the United States under this Consent Decree are joint and several. The obligations of Settling Defendants to finance and perform the area-specific Vadose Zone Work and to pay any penalties and Future Response Costs related to the specific areas addressed in Appendix B.2-B.3, B.5-B.10 are joint and several for each specific area among the Settling Defendants identified as potentially responsible parties in Appendix D to this Consent Decree. In the event of the insolvency or other failure of any one or more Settling Defendants to implement the requirements of this Consent Decree, the remaining Settling Defendants obligated to meet such requirements under this Consent Decree shall complete all such requirements.

#### 7. Compliance With Applicable Law

this Consent Decree shall be performed in accordance with the requirements of all applicable federal and state laws and regulations. Settling Defendants must also comply with all applicable or relevant and appropriate requirements of all federal and state environmental laws as set forth in the ROD and the SOWs. The activities conducted pursuant to this Consent Decree, if approved by EPA, shall be considered to be consistent with the NCP.

27

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

. 19

## 8. Permits

. 9

- a. As provided in Section 121(e) of CERCLA and \$300.400(e) of the NCP, no permit shall be required for any portion of the Joint or Vadose Zone Work conducted entirely on-site. Where any portion of the Joint or Vadose Zone Work requires a federal or state permit or approval, Settling Defendants shall submit timely and complete applications and take all other actions necessary to obtain all such permits or approvals.
- provisions of Section XIX (Force Majeure) of this Consent Decree for any delay in the performance of the Joint or Vadose Zone Work resulting from a failure to obtain, or a delay in obtaining, any permit required for such Work.
- c. This Consent Decree is not, and shall not be construed to be, a permit issued pursuant to any federal or state statute or regulation.

#### 9. Notice of Obligations to Successors-in-Title

a. In the event any Defendant transfers property in the areas addressed in Appendices B.2-B.3, B.5-B.10, or where any groundwater monitoring well is located pursuant to this Consent Decree, prior to issuance of the Certification of Completion of the Joint or Vadose Zone Work for the specific property to be transferred, that Defendant shall (1) assure that the deed, title or other instrument effecting conveyance or transfer of title appends a copy of this Consent Decree, the 1991 ROD and the listing of the site on the NPL; and (2) record an easement on behalf of the United States and its representatives, including, but not limited to, its contractors, for access to the property

of the third party. Thereafter, each deed, title, or other instrument conveying an interest in the affected property prior to issuance of the Certification of Completion of the Joint or Vadose Zone Work shall contain a notice that the property is subject to this Consent Decree and any restrictions applicable to the property under this Consent Decree.

- b. The obligations of each Owner Defendant with respect to the provision of access under Section X (Access) shall be binding upon any and all such Defendants and any and all persons who subsequently acquire any such interest or portion thereof (hereinafter "Successors-in-Title") prior to issuance of the Certification of Completion of the Joint or Vadose Zone Work for the property transferred.
- c. Prior to EPA's issuance of the Certification of Completion for Joint or Vadose Zone Work, any Owner Defendant and/or any Successor-in-Title shall, at least 60 days prior to the conveyance of any such interest, give written notice of this Consent Decree to the grantee and written notice to EPA of the proposed conveyance, including the name and address of the grantee, and the date on which notice of the Consent Decree was given to the grantee. In the event of any such conveyance, except a conveyance resulting from the exercise of the power of eminent domain, the Defendants' obligations under this Consent Decree, including their obligations to provide or secure access pursuant to Section X (Access), shall continue to be met by the respective Defendants. In addition, if the United States approves, the grantee may perform some or all of the Joint or Vadose Zone Work under this Consent Decree. In no event shall

. 5

the conveyance of an interest in property that includes, or is a portion of, the Site release or otherwise affect the liability of the Defendants to comply with the Consent Decree.

# VI. PERFORMANCE OF THE JOINT AND VADOSE ZONE WORK BY SETTLING DEFENDANTS

10. <u>Selection of Supervising Contractor</u>.

1

2

3

- 5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

a. All aspects of the Joint and Vadose Zone Work to be performed by Settling Defendants pursuant to Sections VI (Performance of the Joint and Vadose Zone Work by Settling Defendants), VII (Additional Response Actions), VIII (EPA

Periodic Review), and IX (Quality Assurance, Sampling, and Data Analysis) of this Consent Decree shall be under the direction and supervision of the Supervising Contractor(s), the selection of which shall be subject to disapproval by EPA. Settling Defendants shall select one Supervising Contractor for the Joint Work and one Supervising Contractor for each area of Vadose Zone Work identified in Appendix B.2-B.3, B.5-B.10. Salt River Project shall be the initial Supervising Contractor for the Joint Work. Salt River Project's obligations as Supervising Contractor for Joint Work shall terminate three years after the initiation of periodic sampling of Phase I monitoring wells, as described in Section 3 of Appendix B.11. At least 120 days prior to such termination, the Settling Defendants shall propose a new Supervising Contractor for the Joint Work and the Parties shall proceed as described in subparagraph 10.b below. The Supervising Contractors for the Vadose Zone Work in each area are either listed in Appendix E to this Consent Decree or, within 10 days after the lodging of this Consent Decree, Settling Defendants

- shall notify EPA in writing of the name, title, and qualifications of any contractor proposed to be the Supervising Contractor. EPA will issue a notice of disapproval or an authorization to proceed.
- b. If at any time after a Supervising Contractor is designated, Settling Defendants propose to change a Supervising Contractor, Settling Defendants shall give and must obtain an authorization to proceed from EPA, before the new Supervising Contractor performs, directs, or supervises any Joint or Vadose Zone Work under this Consent Decree.
- c. If EPA disapproves a proposed Supervising Contractor, EPA will notify Settling Defendants in writing. Settling Defendants shall submit to EPA a list of contractors, including the qualifications of each contractor, that would be acceptable to them within 30 days of receipt of EPA's disapproval of the contractor previously proposed. EPA will provide written notice of the names of any contractor(s) that it disapproves and an authorization to proceed with respect to any of the other contractors. Settling Defendants may select any contractor from that list that is not disapproved and shall notify EPA of the name of the contractor selected within 21 days of EPA's authorization to proceed.
- d. If EPA fails to provide written notice of its authorization to proceed or disapproval as provided in this Paragraph and this failure prevents the Settling Defendants from meeting one or more deadlines in a plan approved by the EPA pursuant to this Consent Decree, Settling Defendants may seek

\_19

relief under the provisions of Section XIX (Force Majeure) hereof.

#### 11. Remedial Design/Remedial Action.

- a. The Settling Defendants shall implement the SOWs set forth in Appendices B.2-B.3, B.5-B.11, which are incorporated into and are enforceable under this Consent Decree. The Settling Defendants shall submit to EPA and the State all plans, submittals and other deliverables required under Appendices B.2-B.3, B.5-B.11-in accordance with the approved schedules for review and approval pursuant to Section XII (Submissions Requiring Agency Approval).
- b. As identified in the SOWs, the Settling Defendants shall submit to EPA and the State Health and Safety Plans for field activities which conform to the applicable Occupational Safety and Health Administration and EPA requirements including, but not limited to, 29 C.F.R. § 1910.120.
- Defendants pursuant to this Consent Decree shall include the obligation to achieve the Performance Standards. In accordance with the definition of "Performance Standards" under Section IV (Definitions) of this Consent Decree, Settling Defendants may petition EPA if they believe that a substance is naturally occurring in NIBW groundwater within the meaning of \$ 104(a)(3)(A) of CERCLA. Settling Defendants may so petition EPA no more than one time per year. EPA shall then make a determination whether the substance is naturally occurring in NIBW groundwater within the meaning of \$ 104(a)(3)(A) of CERCLA. EPA's determination under the preceding sentence shall be subject

to the provisions of Paragraph 64 of Section XX (Dispute Resolution) of this Consent Decree.

- 13. Settling Defendants acknowledge and agree that nothing in this Consent Decree, or the SOWs, constitutes a warranty or representation of any kind by Plaintiff that compliance with the work requirements set forth in Appendices B.2-B.3, B.5-B.11 will achieve the Performance Standards. Settling Defendants' compliance with the work requirements shall not foreclose Plaintiff from seeking compliance with all terms and conditions of this Consent Decree, including, but not limited to, the applicable Performance Standards.
- 14. Settling Defendants shall, prior to any off-Site shipment of Waste Material generated in performing the Joint or Vadose Zone Work from the Site to an out-of-state waste management facility, provide written notification to the appropriate state environmental official in the receiving facility's state and to the EPA Project Coordinator of such shipment of Waste Material. However, this notification requirement shall not apply to any off-Site shipments when the total volume of all such shipments will not exceed 10 cubic yards.
- a. The Settling Defendants shall include in the written notification the following information, where available: (1) the name and location of the facility to which the Waste Material is to be shipped; (2) the type and quantity of the Waste Material to be shipped; (3) the expected schedule for the shipment of the Waste Material; and (4) the method of transportation. The Settling Defendants shall notify the state in which the planned

. 5

receiving facility is located of major changes in the shipment plan, such as a decision to ship the Waste Material to another facility within the same state, or to a facility in another state.

b. The identity of the receiving facility and state will be determined by the Settling Defendants following the award of contracts for Joint or Vadose Zone Work construction, if applicable. The Settling Defendants shall provide the information required by Paragraph 14.a as soon as practicable after the award of the contract and before the Waste Material is actually shipped.

#### VII. ADDITIONAL RESPONSE ACTIONS

- 15. In the event that EPA determines or the Settling
  Defendants propose that additional response actions are necessary
  to meet the Performance Standards or to carry out the remedy(ies)
  selected in the ROD, notification of such additional response
  actions shall be provided to the Project Coordinator for the
  other Parties.
- 16. Within 30 days of receipt of notice from EPA or Settling Defendants pursuant to Paragraph 15 that additional response actions are necessary (or such longer time as may be specified by EPA), those Settling Defendants receiving such notice shall submit for approval by EPA a work plan for the additional response actions. The plan shall conform to the applicable requirements of Paragraph 11. Upon approval of the plan pursuant to Section XII (Submissions Requiring Agency Approval), Settling Defendants shall implement the plan for additional response actions in accordance with the schedule contained therein.

-18

1 2 pr 3 ca 4 ap 5 Se 6 sc

propose are necessary to meet the Performance Standards or to carry out the remedy(ies) selected in the ROD shall be subject to approval by EPA and, if authorized by EPA, shall be completed by Settling Defendants in accordance with plans, specifications, and schedules approved or established by EPA pursuant to Section XII (Submissions Requiring Agency Approval).

17. Any additional response actions that Settling Defendants

18. Settling Defendants may invoke the procedures set forth in Section XX (Dispute Resolution) to dispute EPA's determination that additional response actions are necessary to meet the Performance Standards or to carry out the remedy(ies) selected in the ROD. Such a dispute shall be resolved pursuant to Paragraphs 61-64 of this Consent Decree.

## VIII. EPA PERIODIC REVIEW

- 19. Settling Defendants shall conduct any studies and investigations as requested by EPA in order to permit EPA to conduct reviews at least every five years as required by Section 121(c) of CERCLA and any applicable regulations.
- 20. If required by Sections 113(k)(2) or 117 of CERCLA,
  Settling Defendants and the public will be provided with an
  opportunity to comment on any further response actions proposed
  by EPA as a result of the review conducted pursuant to Section
  121(c) of CERCLA and to submit written comments for the record
  during the public comment period. After the period for
  submission of written comments is closed, the Regional
  Administrator, EPA Region 9, or his/her delegate will determine
  in writing whether further response actions are appropriate.

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

delegate determines that information received, in whole or in part, during the review conducted pursuant to Section 121(c) of CERCLA, indicates that the Joint Remedial Action or Vadose Zone Work is not protective of human health and the environment, the Settling Defendants shall undertake any further response actions EPA has determined are appropriate, unless their liability for such further response actions is barred by the Covenant Not to Sue set forth in Section XXII. Settling Defendants for the Joint Remedial Action or area-specific Vadose Zone Work, as appropriate, shall submit a plan for such work to EPA for approval in accordance with the procedures set forth in Section VI (Performance of the Joint and Vadose Zone Work by Settling Defendants) and shall implement the plan approved by EPA. appropriate Settling Defendants may invoke the procedures set forth in Section XX (Dispute Resolution) to dispute (1) EPA's determination that the remedial action is not protective of human health and the environment, (2) EPA's selection of the further response actions ordered as arbitrary and capricious or otherwise not in accordance with law, or (3) EPA's determination that the

If the Regional Administrator, EPA Region 9, or his/her

not in accordance with law, or (3) EPA's determination that the Settling Defendants' liability for the further response actions requested is reserved in Paragraphs 78, 79, or 81 or otherwise not barred by the Covenant Not to Sue set forth in Section XXII.

## IX. QUALITY ASSURANCE, SAMPLING, and DATA ANALYSIS

22. Settling Defendants shall use quality assurance, quality control, and chain of custody procedures for all design, compliance and monitoring samples in accordance with EPA's "Interim Guidelines and Specifications For Preparing Quality

Assurance Project Plans, December 1980, (QAMS-005/80); "Data Quality Objective Guidance, " (EPA/540/G87/003 and 004); "EPA NEIC Policies and Procedures Manual, May 1978, revised August 1991, (EPA 330/9-78-001-R); and subsequent amendments to such guidelines upon notification by EPA to Settling Defendants of such amendment. Amended guidelines shall apply only to procedures conducted after such notification. Prior to the commencement of any monitoring project under this Consent Decree, Settling Defendants shall submit to EPA for approval a Quality Assurance Project Plan ("QAPP") to EPA and the State that is consistent with the SOW, the NCP, and U.S. EPA Region 9 "Guidance for Preparing Quality Assurance Project Plans for Superfund Remedial Projects" (September, 1989). The Settling Defendants have previously developed and submitted to EPA a QAPP for monitoring of the MAU and LAU under the SOUCD which has been approved by EPA. To the extent that EPA determines that the QAPP developed under the SOUCD is applicable, those portions of the QAPP shall be used for monitoring activities under this Consent-If relevant to the proceeding, the Parties agree that Decree. validated sampling data generated in accordance with the QAPP(s) and reviewed and approved by EPA shall be admissible as evidence, without objection, in any proceeding under this Decree. Defendants shall ensure that EPA and State personnel and their authorized representatives are allowed access at reasonable times to all laboratories utilized by Settling Defendants in implementing this Consent Decree. In addition, Settling Defendants shall ensure that such laboratories shall analyze all samples submitted by EPA pursuant to the QAPP for quality

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

assurance monitoring. Settling Defendants shall ensure that the 1 laboratories they utilize for the analysis of samples taken 2 pursuant to this Decree perform all analyses according to 3 accepted EPA methods. Accepted EPA methods include, but are not 4 5 limited to, those methods which are documented in the "Contract 6 Lab Program Statement of Work for Inorganic Analysis Multimedia, 7 Multiconcentration, Document #ILM 02.0" and the "Contract Lab Program Statement of Work for Organic Analysis, Multimedia, Multiconcentration, Document #OLM 01.0", and any amendments or revisions made thereto during the course of the implementation of 10 11 this Decree. Settling Defendants shall ensure that all laboratories they use for analysis of samples taken pursuant to 12 13 this Consent Decree participate in an EPA or EPA-equivalent QA/QC 14 program.

- 23. Upon request, the Settling Defendants shall allow split or duplicate samples to be taken by EPA and the State or their authorized representatives. Settling Defendants shall notify EPA and the State not less than 14 days in advance of any sample collection activity unless shorter notice is agreed to by EPA. In addition, EPA and the State shall have the right to take any additional samples that EPA deems necessary. Upon request, EPA and the State shall allow the Settling Defendants to take split or duplicate samples of any samples they take as part of EPA's oversight of the Settling Defendants' implementation of the Joint or Vadose Zone Work.
- 24. Settling Defendants shall submit to EPA and the State three copies of the results of all sampling and/or tests or other data obtained or generated by or on behalf of Settling Defendants

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

with respect to the Site and/or the implementation of this Consent Decree unless EPA agrees otherwise.

25. Notwithstanding any provision of this Consent Decree, the United States hereby retains all of its information gathering and inspection authorities and rights, including enforcement actions related thereto, under CERCLA, RCRA and any other applicable statutes or regulations.

#### X. ACCESS

- 26. a. Commencing upon the date of lodging of this Consent
  Decree, the Defendants agree to provide the United States, the
  State, and their representatives, including EPA and its
  contractors, access at all reasonable times to the Site and any
  other property to which access is required for the implementation
  of this Consent Decree, to the extent access to the property is
  controlled by Defendants, for the purposes of conducting any
  activity related to this Consent Decree including, but not
  limited to:
  - i. Monitoring the Joint and/or Vadose Zone Work;
- ii. Verifying any data or information submitted to the United States;
- iii. Conducting investigations relating to contamination
  at or near the Site;
  - iv. Obtaining samples;
- v. Assessing the need for, planning, or implementing additional response actions at or near the Site;
- vi. Inspecting and copying records, operating logs, contracts, or other documents maintained or generated by Settling Defendants or their agents, consistent with Section XXV; and

-9

=18

vii. Assessing Settling Defendants' compliance with this Consent Decree.

With respect to Settling Defendant the City of Scottsdale, the requirements of this Section shall apply only to Area 7.

- b. Cash Defendants shall provide to Settling Defendants access at all reasonable times to the Site and any other property to which access is required for the purposes of conducting any activity necessary for the implementation of this Consent Decree including, but not limited to, the activities identified in subparagraphs (i)-(vii) of subparagraph 26.a. Such access shall be coordinated with Cash Defendants in order to minimize interference with ongoing activities on the property. Cash Defendants shall not be entitled to compensation for providing access needed to implement the Consent Decree.
- which access is required for the implementation of this Consent
  Decree is owned or controlled by persons other than Settling
  Defendants, Settling Defendants shall use best efforts to secure from such persons access for Settling Defendants, as well as for
  the United States and their representatives, including, but not
  limited to, their contractors, as necessary to effectuate this
  Consent Decree. For purposes of this Paragraph "best efforts"
  includes the payment of reasonable sums of money in consideration
  of access. If any access required to complete the Joint or
  Vadose Zone Work is not obtained within 45 days of the effective
  date of this Consent Decree, or within 45 days of the date EPA
  notifies the Settling Defendants in writing that additional
  access beyond that previously secured is necessary, Settling

. 2

Defendants shall promptly notify the United States, and shall include in that notification a summary of the steps Settling Defendants have taken to attempt to obtain access. The United States or the State may, as it deems appropriate, assist Settling Defendants in obtaining access. Settling Defendants shall reimburse the United States, in accordance with the procedures in Section XVII (Reimbursement of Response Costs), for all costs incurred by the United States in obtaining access.

28. Notwithstanding any provision of this Consent Decree, the United States retains all of its access authorities and rights, including enforcement authorities related thereto, under CERCLA, RCRA and any other applicable statute or regulations.

## XI. REPORTING REQUIREMENTS

29. a. Joint Work. In addition to reporting requirements in the SOWs and any other requirement of this Consent Decree, during construction of monitoring wells Settling Defendants shall submit to EPA and the State three (3) copies of written monthly progress reports that: (1) describe the actions that have been taken toward achieving compliance with this Consent Decree during the previous month; (2) include a summary of all results of sampling and tests and all other data received or generated by Settling Defendants or their contractors or agents in the previous month; (3) identify all plans and other deliverables required by this Consent Decree completed and submitted during the previous month; (4) describe all actions, including, but not limited to, data collection and implementation of the SOW, which are scheduled for the next six weeks and provide other information relating to the progress of construction; (5) include information regarding

percentage of completion, unresolved delays encountered or anticipated that may affect the future schedule for implementation of the Joint Work, and a description of efforts made to mitigate those delays or anticipated delays; (6) include any modifications to the SOW or other schedules that Settling Defendants have proposed to EPA or that have been approved by EPA; and (7) describe all activities undertaken in support of the Community Relations Plan during the previous month and those to be undertaken in the next six weeks. Settling Defendants shall submit these progress reports to EPA and the State by the tenth day of every month following the lodging of this Consent Decree until EPA notifies the Settling Defendants pursuant to Paragraph 47.b of Section XV (Certification of Completion). If requested by EPA, Settling Defendants shall also provide briefings for EPA and the State to discuss the progress of the Joint Work. construction of monitoring wells has been completed, no further monthly progress reports for Joint Work are required.

p. Area-specific Vadose Zone Work. In addition to reporting requirements in the SOWs and any other requirement of this Consent Decree, Settling Defendants shall submit to EPA and the State three (3) copies of written monthly progress reports that: (1) describe the actions which have been taken toward achieving compliance with this Consent Decree during the previous month; (2) include a summary of all results of sampling and tests and all other data received or generated by Settling Defendants or their contractors or agents in the previous month; (3) identify all plans and other deliverables required by this Consent Decree completed and submitted during the previous month;

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

(4) describe all actions, including, but not limited to, data 1 collection and implementation of the SOW, which are scheduled for 2 the next six weeks and provide other information relating to the 3 progress of construction; (5) include information regarding 4 percentage of completion, unresolved delays encountered or · 5 anticipated that may affect the future schedule for 6 7 implementation of the Vadose Zone Work, and a description of efforts made to mitigate those delays or anticipated delays; (6) 8 include any modifications to the SOW or other schedules that 9 10 Settling Defendants have proposed to EPA or that have been approved by EPA; and (7) describe all activities undertaken in 11 support of the Community Relations Plan during the previous month 12 and those to be undertaken in the next six weeks. 13 14 Defendants shall submit these progress reports to EPA and the 15 State by the tenth day of every month following the lodging of 16 this Consent Decree until EPA notifies the Settling Defendants pursuant to Paragraph 46.b of Section XV (Certification of 17 18 Completion). If requested by EPA, Settling Defendants shall also 19 provide briefings for EPA and the State to discuss the progress 20 of the Vadose Zone Work. After EPA issues its Certificate of 21 Completion for Vadose Zone Work for specific vadose zone areas,

30. The Settling Defendants shall notify EPA of any change in the schedule described in the monthly progress report for the performance of any activity, including, but not limited to, data collection and implementation of the SOW, no later than seven days prior to the performance of the activity.

no further monthly progress reports are required for such areas.

28

22

23

24

25

26

1 the Joint or Vadose Zone Work that Settling Defendants are 2 3 required to report pursuant to Section 103 of CERCLA or Section 304 of the Emergency Planning and Community Right-to-know Act 4 (EPCRA), Settling Defendants shall within 24 hours of the onset . 5 of such event orally notify the EPA Project Coordinator or the 6 Alternate EPA Project Coordinator (in the event of the 7 unavailability of the EPA Project Coordinator), or, in the event 8 9 10 11

14

15

16

17

18

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

that neither the EPA Project Coordinator or Alternate EPA Project Coordinator is available, the Emergency Response Section, Region 9, United States Environmental Protection Agency. reporting requirements are in addition to the reporting required 12 by CERCLA Section 103 or EPCRA Section 304. 13

Upon the occurrence of any event during performance of

- Within 20 days of the onset of such an event, Settling Defendants shall furnish to Plaintiffs a written report, signed by the Settling Defendants' Project Coordinator, setting forth the events which occurred and the measures taken, and to be taken, in response thereto. Within 30 days of the conclusion of such an event, Settling Defendants shall submit a report setting forth all actions taken in response thereto.
- Settling Defendants shall submit to EPA three (3) copies of all plans, reports, and data required by Appendices B.2-B.3, B.5-B.11 in accordance with the schedules set forth in such appendices. Settling Defendants shall simultaneously submit three copies of all such plans, reports and data to the State.
- All reports and other documents submitted by Settling Defendants to EPA (other than the monthly progress reports 28 referred to above) which purport to document Settling Defendants'

compliance with the terms of this Consent Decree shall be signed by an authorized representative of the Settling Defendants.

35. Upon the request of any Party, the Party receiving the request shall make available to the requesting Party(ies) the results of sampling and/or tests or other data generated under this Consent Decree by such Party, or by individuals or entities acting on their behalf.

## XII. SUBMISSIONS REQUIRING AGENCY APPROVAL

- 36. After review of any plan, report or other item which is required to be submitted for approval pursuant to this Consent Decree, EPA shall: (a) approve, in whole or in part, the submission; (b) approve the submission upon specified conditions; (c) modify the submission to cure the deficiencies; (d) disapprove, in whole or in part, the submission, directing that the Settling Defendants modify the submission; or (e) any combination of the above.
- 37. In the event of approval, approval upon conditions, or modification by EPA, pursuant to Paragraph 36(a), (b), or (c), Settling Defendants shall proceed to take any action required by the plan, report, or other item, as approved or modified by EPA subject only to their right to invoke the Dispute Resolution procedures set forth in Section XX (Dispute Resolution) with respect to the modifications or conditions made by EPA. In the event that EPA modifies the submission to cure the deficiencies pursuant to Paragraph 36(c) and the submission has a material defect, EPA retains its right to seek stipulated penalties, as provided in Section XXI.

,19

- Upon receipt of a notice of disapproval pursuant to Paragraph 36(d), Settling Defendants shall, within 21 days or such other time as specified by EPA in such notice, correct the deficiencies and resubmit the plan, report, or other item for approval. Any stipulated penalties applicable to the submission, as provided in Section XXI, shall accrue during the 21-day period or otherwise specified period but shall not be payable unless the resubmission is disapproved or modified due to a material defect as provided in Paragraph 39.
- b. Notwithstanding the receipt of a notice of disapproval pursuant to Paragraph 36(d), Settling Defendants shall proceed, at the direction of EPA, to take any action required by any nondeficient portion of the submission. Implementation of any nondeficient portion of a submission shall not relieve Settling Defendants of any liability for stipulated penalties under Section XXI (Stipulated Penalties).
- In the event that a resubmitted plan, report or other 39. item, or portion thereof, is disapproved by EPA, EPA may again require the Settling Defendants to correct the deficiencies, in accordance with the preceding Paragraphs. EPA also retains the right to amend or develop the plan, report or other item. Settling Defendants shall implement any such plan, report, or item as amended or developed by EPA, subject only to their right to invoke the procedures set forth in Section XX (Dispute Resolution).
- 40. If upon resubmission, a plan, report, or item is disapproved or modified by EPA due to a material defect, Settling 28 Defendants shall be deemed to have failed to submit such plan,

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

.18

. 1 Q

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

report, or item timely and adequately unless the Settling 1 Defendants invoke the dispute resolution procedures set forth in 2 Section XX (Dispute Resolution) and EPA's action is overturned 3 pursuant to that Section. The provisions of Section XX (Dispute 4 Resolution) and Section XXI (Stipulated Penalties) shall govern 5 the implementation of the Joint and Vadose Zone Work and accrual 6 and payment of any stipulated penalties during Dispute 7 Resolution. If EPA's disapproval or modification is upheld, 8 stipulated penalties shall accrue for such violation from the 9 10 date on which the initial submission was originally required, as provided in Section XXI. 11

41. All plans, reports, and other items required to be submitted to EPA under this Consent Decree shall, upon approval or modification by EPA, be enforceable under this Consent Decree. In the event EPA approves or modifies a portion of a plan, report, or other item required to be submitted to EPA under this Consent Decree, the approved or modified portion shall be enforceable under this Consent Decree.

#### XIII. PROJECT COORDINATORS

Within 20 days of lodging this Consent Decree, Settling Defendants and EPA will notify each other, in writing, of the name, address and telephone number of their respective designated Project Coordinators and Alternate Project Coordinators. Settling Defendants shall identify one Project Coordinator and Alternate Project Coordinator for the Joint Work and one Project Coordinator and Alternate Project Coordinator for each separate area-specific Vadose Zone Work. If a Project Coordinator or 28 Alternate Project Coordinator initially designated is changed,

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

the identity of the successor will be given to the other parties at least 5 working days before the changes occur, unless impracticable, but in no event later than the actual day the change is made. The Settling Defendants' Project Coordinator shall be subject to disapproval by EPA and shall have the technical expertise sufficient to adequately oversee all aspects of the Joint and/or Vadose Zone Work. The Settling Defendants' Project Coordinator shall not be an attorney who is representing any of the Settling Defendants as an attorney in this matter. He or she may assign other representatives, including other contractors, to serve as a Site representative for oversight of performance of daily operations during remedial activities.

43. EPA may designate other representatives, including, but not limited to, EPA employees, and federal contractors and consultants, to observe and monitor the progress of any activity undertaken pursuant to this Consent Decree. EPA's Project Coordinator and Alternate Project Coordinator shall have the authority lawfully vested in a Remedial Project Manager (RPM) and an On-Scene Coordinator (OSC) by the National Contingency Plan,

40 C.F.R. Part 300. In addition, EPA's Project Coordinator or Alternate Project Coordinator shall have authority, consistent with the National Contingency Plan, to halt any Joint or Vadose Zone Work required by this Consent Decree and to take any necessary response action when s/he determines that conditions at the Site constitute an emergency situation or may present an immediate threat to public health or welfare or the environment due to release or threatened release of Waste Material.

. 19

- 44. Within 30 days of entry of this Consent Decree, Settling Defendants shall establish and maintain financial security in the amount of four million dollars (\$4,000,000.00) for the Joint Work and in the following amounts for each area-specific Vadose Zone Work: (1) three hundred thousand dollars (\$300,000.00) for Area 5A; (2) two hundred fifty thousand dollars (\$250,000.00) for Area 5B; (3) four hundred thousand dollars (\$400,000.00) for Area 6;
- (5) four hundred thousand dollars (\$400,000.00) for Area 8; (6) two hundred fifty thousand dollars (\$250,000.00) for Area 9; (7) three hundred thousand dollars (\$300,000.00) for Area 11; and (8) one million dollars (\$1,000,000.00) for Area 12. One or more of the Settling Defendants shall establish and maintain such financial security for the Joint and area-specific Vadose Zone Work in one of the following forms:

(4) six hundred fifty thousand dollars (\$650,000.00) for Area 7;

- (a) A surety bond guaranteeing performance of the Joint and/or Vadose Zone Work;
- (b) One or more irrevocable letters of credit equalling the total estimated cost of the Joint and/or Vadose Zone Work;
  - (c) A trust fund;
- (d) A guarantee to perform the Joint and/or Vadose Zone Work by one or more parent corporations or subsidiaries, or by one or more unrelated corporations that have a substantial business relationship with at least one of the Settling Defendants; or

- (e) A demonstration that one or more of the Settling
  Defendants satisfy the requirements of 40 C.F.R. § 264.143(f).
  For purposes of compliance with this provision, Siemens
  Corporation shall be deemed to satisfy 40 C.F.R.
  § 264.143(f)(1)(ii)(A) based on a showing that Siemens has issued
  commercial paper with current ratings that are equivalent to, or
  above, the bond ratings identified in that subsection.
- If the Settling Defendants seek to demonstrate the ability to complete the Joint and/or Vadose Zone Work through a guarantee by a third party pursuant to Paragraph 44(d) of this Consent Decree, Settling Defendants shall demonstrate that the quarantor satisfies the requirements of 40 C.F.R. § 264.143(f). If Settling Defendants seek to demonstrate their ability to complete the Joint and/or Vadose Zone Work by means of the financial test or the corporate quarantee pursuant to Paragraph 44(d) or (e), they shall resubmit sworn statements conveying the information required by 40 C.F.R. § 264.143(f) annually, on the anniversary of the effective date of this Consent Decree. event that EPA determines at any time that the financial assurances provided pursuant to this Section are inadequate, Settling Defendants shall, within 30 days of receipt of notice of EPA's determination, obtain and present to EPA for approval one of the other forms of financial assurance listed in Paragraph 44 of this Consent Decree. Settling Defendants' inability to demonstrate financial ability to complete the Joint or Vadose Zone Work shall not excuse performance of any activities required under this Consent Decree.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12 13

14

15 16

17

18

19

20 21

22

23

25

26

27

28

NIBW 2ND CONSENT DECREE

46. Completion of the Joint Remedial Action and Vadose Zone
Work

Within 90 days after Settling Defendants conclude that the Joint Remedial Action has been fully performed and the Performance Standards have been attained in accordance with Appendix B.11 or within 90 days after each individual or group of Settling Defendants obligated to conduct area-specific Vadose Zone Work concludes that Vadose Zone Work (including operation and maintenance) for such specific area has been fully performed and the Performance Standards have been attained in accordance with Appendices B.2-B.3, B.5-B.10, Settling Defendants shall schedule and conduct a pre-certification inspection to be attended by Settling Defendants, EPA and, at EPA's option, the State. If, after the pre-certification inspection, the Settling Defendants still believe that the Joint Remedial Action or Vadose Zone Work has been fully performed and the Performance Standards have been attained, they shall submit a written report requesting certification to EPA for approval, with a copy to-the-State, --pursuant to Section XII (Submissions Requiring Agency Approval) within 30 days of the inspection. In the report, a registered professional engineer or geologist, as appropriate, and the Settling Defendants' Project Coordinator shall state that the Joint Remedial Action or Vadose Zone Work has been completed in full satisfaction of the requirements of this Consent Decree. The written report shall include as-built drawings signed and stamped by a professional engineer or geologist, as appropriate, if not previously provided to EPA. The report shall contain the

following statement, signed by a responsible corporate official of a Settling Defendant or the Settling Defendants' Project Coordinator:

"To the best of my knowledge, after thorough investigation, I certify that the information contained in or accompanying this submission is true, accurate and complete. I am aware that there are significant penalties for submitting false information, including the possibility of fine and imprisonment for knowing violations."

7

3

5

6

q

10

11

12 13

14

15

16

17

18

<u>19</u> 20

21

22

2324

25

26

2728

If, after completion of the pre-certification inspection and receipt and review of the written report, EPA determines that the Joint Remedial Action or Vadose Zone Work or any portion thereof has not been completed in accordance with this Consent Decree or that the Performance Standards have not been achieved, EPA will notify Settling Defendants in writing of the activities that must be undertaken to complete the Joint Remedial Action or Vadose Zone Work and achieve the Performance Standards. EPA will set forth in the notice a schedule for performance of such activities consistent with the Consent Decree and the SOW or require the Settling Defendants to submit a schedule to EPA for approval pursuant to Section XII (Submissions Requiring Agency Approval). Settling Defendants shall perform all activities described in the notice in accordance with the specifications and schedules established pursuant to this Paragraph, subject to their right to invoke the dispute resolution procedures set forth in Section XX (Dispute Resolution).

b. If EPA concludes, based on the initial or any subsequent report requesting Certification of Completion that the Joint Remedial Action or all phases of Vadose Zone Work for a specific area have been fully performed in accordance with this

Consent Decree and that the Performance Standards have been 11 2 achieved, EPA will so certify in writing to the appropriate Settling and Cash Defendants. This certification shall 3 constitute the Certification of Completion of the Joint Remedial Action or area-specific Vadose Zone Work for purposes of this . 5 Consent Decree, including, but not limited to, Section XXII 6 (Covenants Not to Sue by Plaintiff). Certification of Completion 7 of the Vadose Zone Work shall not affect Settling Defendants' obligations (other than those that pertain solely to Vadose Zone 9-Work) under this Consent Decree. Certification of Completion of 10 the Joint Remedial Action shall not affect Settling Defendants' obligations (other than those that pertain solely to the Joint 12 Remedial Action) under this Consent Decree. 13

The requirements of this Paragraph 46 apply separately to the Joint Remedial Action and to area-specific Vadose Zone Work identified in Appendix B.2-B.3, B.5-B.10.

### Completion of the Joint Work

a. Within 90 days after Settling Defendants conclude that all phases of the Joint Work (including O & M) have been fully performed under this Consent Decree, including Appendix B.11, Settling Defendants shall schedule and conduct a precertification inspection to be attended by Settling Defendants, EPA and, at EPA's option, the State. If, after the precertification inspection, the Settling Defendants still believe that the Joint Work has been fully performed, Settling Defendants shall submit a written report by a registered professional engineer or geologist, as appropriate, stating that the Joint 28 Work has been completed in full satisfaction of the requirements

8

11

14

15

16

17

18

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

of this Consent Decree. The report shall contain the following statement, signed by a responsible corporate official of a Settling Defendant or the Settling Defendants' Project Coordinator:

"To the best of my knowledge, after thorough investigation, I certify that the information contained in or accompanying this submission is true, accurate and complete. I am aware that there are significant penalties for submitting false information, including the possibility of fine and imprisonment for knowing violations."

If, after review of the written report, EPA determines that any portion of the Joint Work has not been completed in accordance with this Consent Decree, EPA will notify Settling Defendants in writing of the activities that must be undertaken to complete the Joint Work. EPA will set forth in the notice a schedule for performance of such activities consistent with the Consent Decree and the SOW or require the Settling Defendants to submit a schedule to EPA for approval pursuant to Section XII (Submissions Requiring Agency Approval). Settling Defendants shall perform all activities described in the notice in accordance with the specifications and schedules established therein, subject to their right to invoke the dispute resolution procedures set forth in Section XX (Dispute Resolution).

b. If EPA concludes, based on the initial or any subsequent request for Certification of Completion by Settling Defendants that the Joint Work has been fully performed in accordance with this Consent Decree, EPA will so notify the Settling and Cash Defendants in writing.

#### XVI. **EMERGENCY RESPONSE**

- In the event of any action or occurrence during the performance of the Joint or Vadose Zone Work which causes or threatens a release of Waste Material from the Site that constitutes an emergency situation or may present an immediate threat to public health or welfare or the environment, Settling 6 Defendants shall, subject to Paragraph 49, immediately take all appropriate action to prevent, abate, or minimize such release or threat of release, and shall immediately notify the EPA's Project Coordinator, or, if the Project Coordinator is unavailable, EPA's Alternate Project Coordinator. If neither of these persons is available, the Settling Defendants shall notify the EPA Emergency Response Section, Region 9. Settling Defendants shall take such actions in consultation with EPA's Project Coordinator or other available authorized EPA officer and in accordance with all applicable provisions of the Health and Safety Plans, the Contingency Plans, and any other applicable plans or documents developed pursuant to the SOW. In the event that Settling 18 Defendants fail to take appropriate response action as required by this Section, and EPA takes such action instead, Settling Defendants shall reimburse EPA all costs of the response action not inconsistent with the NCP pursuant to Section XVII (Reimbursement of Response Costs).
- Nothing in the preceding Paragraph or in this Consent Decree shall be deemed to limit any authority of the United States to take, direct, or order all appropriate action or to seek an order from the Court to protect human health and the 28 environment or to prevent, abate, respond to, or minimize an

1

2

3

5

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

actual or threatened release of Waste Material on, at, or from the Site.

## XVII. REIMBURSEMENT OF RESPONSE COSTS

- Decree, Settling Defendants shall pay to the United States \$5,066,048.44, in reimbursement of Past Response Costs, by Electronic Funds Transfer ("EFT" or wire transfer) to the U.S. Department of Justice lockbox bank, referencing CERCLA Site

  Number 9T20, DOJ Case Number 90-11-2-413B, and the U.S.A.O. file number 9204626. Payment shall be made in accordance with instructions provided by the Plaintiff to the Settling Defendants upon execution of the Consent Decree. Any EFTs received at the U.S. D.O.J. lockbox after 11:00 A.M. (Eastern Time) will be credited on the next business day. Upon payment by EFT, Settling Defendants shall notify EPA and DOJ in writing and by telefax, as specified in Section XXVII (Notices and Submissions).
- b. Each Cash Defendant has made a cash payment to one or more Settling Defendants in contribution toward the Settling Defendants' payment of Past and Future Response Costs and or for performance of Joint Work or Vadose Zone Work.
- 51. Settling Defendants shall reimburse the United States for all Future Response Costs not inconsistent with the National Contingency Plan incurred by the United States. On an annual basis, the United States will send Settling Defendants a bill requiring payment that consists of a summary of costs incurred by the Department of Justice and a copy of EPA's Cost Documentation Management System ("CDMS") report, which includes direct and indirect costs incurred by EPA and its contractors. The

-18

documentation provided by the United States shall include separate accounting for Joint Work and each area of Vadose Zone Work. In accordance with the requirements set forth in Paragraph 6 of this Consent Decree, Settling Defendants shall make all payments within 30 days of Settling Defendants' receipt of each bill requiring payment, except as provided in Paragraph 52. The Settling Defendants shall make all payments required by this Paragraph in the form of a certified check or checks made payable to "EPA Hazardous Substance Superfund" and referencing the CERCLA Site Number provided by EPA and DOJ Case Number 90-11-2-413B. The Settling Defendants shall forward the certified check or checks to U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 9, Superfund Accounting, P.O. Box 360863M, Pittsburgh, PA 15251, and shall send copies of the check to the United States as specified in Section XXVII (Notices and Submissions).

Response Costs under Paragraph 51 if they determine that the United States has made an accounting error or if they allege that a cost item that is included represents costs that are inconsistent with the NCP. Such objection shall be made in writing within 30 days of receipt of the bill and must be sent to the United States, pursuant to Section XXVII (Notices and Submissions). Any such objection shall specifically identify the contested Future Response Costs and the basis for objection. In the event of an objection, the Settling Defendants shall within the 30 day period pay all uncontested Future Response Costs to the United States in the manner described in Paragraph 50. Simultaneously, the Settling Defendants shall establish an

interest bearing escrow account in a federally-insured bank duly chartered in the State of Arizona and remit to that escrow account funds equivalent to the amount of the contested Future Response Costs. The Settling Defendants shall send to the United States, as provided in Section XXVII (Notices and Submissions), a copy of the transmittal letter and check paying the uncontested Future Response Costs, and a copy of the correspondence that establishes and funds the escrow account, including, but notlimited to, information containing the identity of the bank and bank account under which the escrow account is established as well as a bank statement showing the initial balance of the escrow account. Simultaneously with establishment of the escrow account, the Settling Defendants shall initiate the Dispute Resolution procedures in Section XX (Dispute Resolution). United States prevails in the dispute, within 5 days of the resolution of the dispute, the Settling Defendants shall pay the sums due (with accrued interest) to the United States in the manner described in Paragraph 51. If the Settling Defendants prevail concerning any aspect of the contested costs, the Settling Defendants shall pay that portion of the costs (plus associated accrued interest) for which they did not prevail to the United States in the manner described in Paragraph 51; Settling Defendants shall be disbursed any balance of the escrow account. The dispute resolution procedures set forth in this Paragraph in conjunction with the procedures set forth in Section XX (Dispute Resolution) shall be the exclusive mechanisms for resolving disputes regarding the Settling Defendants' obligation to reimburse the United States its Future Response Costs.

2

3

4

.5

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

In the event that the payments required by Paragraph 50 are not made within 30 days of the effective date of this Consent Decree or the payments required by Paragraph 51 are not made within 30 days of the Settling Defendants' receipt of the bill, Settling Defendants shall pay interest on the unpaid balance at the rate established pursuant to Section 107(a) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9607. The interest to be paid on Past Response Costs shall begin to accrue on the effective date of the Consent Decree. The interest on Future Response Costs shall begin to accrue on the date of the Settling Defendants' receipt of the bill. Interest shall accrue at the rate specified through the date of the Settling Defendant's payment. Payments of interest made under this Paragraph shall be in addition to such other remedies or sanctions available to Plaintiffs by virtue of Settling Defendants' failure to make timely payments under this Section.

#### INDEMNIFICATION AND INSURANCE XVIII.

The United States does not assume any liability by entering into this agreement or by virtue of any designation of Settling Defendants as EPA's authorized representatives under Section 104(e) of CERCLA. Settling Defendants shall indemnify, save and hold harmless the United States and its officials, agents, employees, contractors, subcontractors, or representatives for or from any and all claims or causes of action arising from, or on account of, acts or omissions of Settling Defendants, their officers, directors, employees, agents, contractors, subcontractors, and any persons acting on 28 their behalf or under their control, in carrying out activities

1

2

3

5

6

7

8.

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

pursuant to this Consent Decree, including, but not limited to, 1 any claims arising from any designation of Settling Defendants as 2 EPA's authorized representatives under Section 104(e) of CERCLA. 3 Further, the Settling Defendants agree to pay the United States 4 all costs they incur including, but not limited to, attorneys 5 fees and other expenses of litigation and settlement arising 6 from, or on account of, claims made against the United States 7 based on acts or omissions of Settling Defendants, their 8 9 officers, directors, employees, agents, contractors, 10 subcontractors, and any persons acting on their behalf or under their control, in carrying out activities pursuant to this 11 Consent Decree. The United States shall not be held out as a 12 party to any contract entered into by or on behalf of Settling 13 Defendants in carrying out activities pursuant to this Consent 14 Decree. Neither the Settling Defendants nor any such contractor 15 shall be considered an agent of the United States. 16

b. Any Settling Defendant who undertakes area-specific

Vadose Zone Work on property owned by a Cash Defendant shall

indemnify, defend, save and hold harmless that Cash Defendant

from any and all claims, liabilities or causes of action arising

from, or on account of, acts or omissions of such Settling

Defendant, its officers, directors, employees, agents,

contractors, subcontractors, and any persons acting on its behalf

or under its control, arising out of the performance of Vadose

Zone Work pursuant to this Consent Decree.

55. Settling Defendants waive all claims against the United States for damages or reimbursement or for set-off of any payments made or to be made to the United States, arising from or

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

on account of any contract, agreement, or arrangement between any one or more of Settling Defendants and any person for performance of Joint or Vadose Zone Work on or relating to the Site, including, but not limited to, claims on account of construction delays. In addition, Settling Defendants shall indemnify and hold harmless the United States with respect to any and all claims for damages or reimbursement arising from or on account of any contract, agreement, or arrangement between any one or more of Settling Defendants and any person for performance of Joint or Vadose Zone Work on or relating to the Site, including, but not limited to, claims on account of construction delays. requirements of this Section apply separately to the Joint Work and to each area of Vadose Zone Work identified in Appendix B.2-B.3, B.5-B.10.

56. No later than 15 days before commencing any on-site Joint or Vadose Zone Work, the appropriate Settling Defendants shall secure, and shall maintain until the first anniversary of EPA's Certification of Completion of the Joint Remedial Action or areaspecific Vadose Zone Work pursuant to Paragraph 46.b. of Section XV (Certification of Completion), comprehensive general liability insurance and automobile insurance with limits of three million dollars (\$3,000,000.00), combined single limit naming as additional insured the United States. In addition, for the duration of this Consent Decree, Settling Defendants shall satisfy, or shall ensure that their contractors or subcontractors satisfy, all applicable laws and regulations regarding the provision of worker's compensation insurance for all persons 28 performing the Joint or Vadose Zone Work on behalf of Settling

2

. 3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

--18

Defendants in furtherance of this Consent Decree. commencement of the Joint or Vadose Zone Work under this Consent Decree, Settling Defendants shall provide to EPA certificates of such insurance and a copy of each insurance policy. Settling Defendants shall resubmit such certificates and, if requested by EPA, copies of policies each year on the anniversary of the effective date of this Consent Decree. If Settling Defendants demonstrate by evidence satisfactory to EPA that any contractor or subcontractor maintains insurance equivalent to that described above, or insurance covering the same risks but in a lesser amount, then, with respect to that contractor or subcontractor, Settling Defendants need provide only that portion of the insurance described above which is not maintained by the contractor or subcontractor. Settling Defendants shall separately comply with the provisions of this Paragraph for Joint Work and for area-specific Vadose Zone Work.

## XIX. FORCE MAJEURE

defined as any event arising from causes beyond the control of the Settling Defendants or of any entity controlled by Settling Defendants, including, but not limited to, their contractors and subcontractors, that delays or prevents the performance of any obligation under this Consent Decree despite Settling Defendants' best efforts to fulfill the obligation. The requirement that the Settling Defendants exercise "best efforts to fulfill the obligation" includes using best efforts to anticipate any potential force majeure event and best efforts to address the effects of any potential force majeure event (1) as it is

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

occurring and (2) following the potential force majeure event,

such that the delay is minimized to the greatest extent possible.

"Force Majeure" does not include financial inability to complete
the Joint or Vadose Zone Work or a failure to attain the

Performance Standards.

If any event occurs or has occurred that may delay the performance of any obligation under this Consent Decree, whether or not caused by a force majeure event, the Settling Defendants shall notify orally EPA's Project Coordinator or, in his or her absence, EPA's Alternate Project Coordinator, within 48 hours of when Settling Defendants first knew or should have known that the event might cause a delay. Within five [5] days thereafter, Settling Defendants shall provide in writing to EPA and the State an explanation and description of the reasons for the delay; the anticipated duration of the delay; all actions taken or to be taken to prevent or minimize the delay; a schedule for implementation of any measures to be taken to prevent or mitigate the delay or the effect of the delay; the Settling Defendants! rationale for attributing such delay to a force majeure event if they intend to assert such a claim; and a statement as to whether, in the opinion of the Settling Defendants, such event may cause or contribute to an endangerment to public health, welfare or the environment. The Settling Defendants shall include with any notice all available documentation supporting their claim that the delay was attributable to a force majeure. Failure to comply with the above requirements shall preclude Settling Defendants from asserting any claim of force majeure for Settling Defendants shall be deemed to have notice that event.

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

of any circumstance of which their contractors or subcontractors had or should have had notice.

If EPA agrees that the delay or anticipated delay is 59. attributable to a force majeure event, the time for performance of the obligations under this Consent Decree that are affected by the force majeure event will be extended by EPA for such time as is necessary to complete those obligations. An extension of the time for performance of the obligations affected by the force majeure event shall not, of itself, extend the time for performance of any other obligation. If EPA does not agree that the delay or anticipated delay has been or will be caused by a force majeure event, EPA will notify the Settling Defendants in writing of its decision. If EPA agrees that the delay is attributable to a force majeure event, EPA will notify the Settling Defendants in writing of the length of the extension, if any, for performance of the obligations affected by the force majeure event.

resolution procedures set forth in Section XX (Dispute Resolution), they shall do so no later than 15 days after receipt of EPA's notice. In any such proceeding, Settling Defendants shall have the burden of demonstrating by a preponderance of the evidence that the delay or anticipated delay has been or will be caused by a force majeure event, that the duration of the delay or the extension sought was or will be warranted under the circumstances, that best efforts were exercised to avoid and mitigate the effects of the delay, and that Settling Defendants complied with the requirements of Paragraphs 57 and 58, above.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

If Settling Defendants carry this burden, the delay at issue shall be deemed not to be a violation by Settling Defendants of the affected obligation of this Consent Decree identified to EPA and the Court.

### XX. DISPUTE RESOLUTION

- 61. Unless otherwise expressly provided for in this Consent Decree, the dispute resolution procedures of this Section shall be the exclusive mechanism to resolve disputes arising under or with respect to this Consent Decree. However, the procedures set forth in this Section shall not apply to actions by the United States to enforce obligations of the Settling Defendants that have not been disputed in accordance with this Section.
- 62. Any dispute which arises under or with respect to this Consent Decree shall in the first instance be the subject of informal negotiations between the parties to the dispute. The period for informal negotiations shall not exceed 20 days from the time the dispute arises, unless it is modified by written agreement of the parties to the dispute. The dispute shall be considered to have arisen when one party sends the other parties a written Notice of Dispute.
- 63. a. In the event that the parties cannot resolve a dispute by informal negotiations under the preceding Paragraph, then the position advanced by EPA shall be considered binding unless, within 10 days after the conclusion of the informal negotiation period, Settling Defendants invoke the formal dispute resolution procedures of this Section by serving on the United States a written Statement of Position on the matter in dispute, including, but not limited to, any factual data, analysis or

- opinion supporting that position and any supporting documentation relied upon by the Settling Defendants. The Statement of Position shall specify the Settling Defendants' position as to whether formal dispute resolution should proceed under paragraph 64 or 65.
- b. Within fourteen (14) days after receipt of Settling
  Defendants' Statement of Position, EPA will serve on Settling
  Defendants its Statement of Position, including, but not limited
  to, any factual data, analysis, or opinion supporting that
  position and all supporting documentation relied upon by EPA.

  EPA's Statement of Position shall include a statement as to
  whether formal dispute resolution should proceed under Paragraph
  64 or 65.
- c. If there is disagreement between EPA and the Settling Defendants as to whether dispute resolution should proceed under Paragraph 64 or 65, the parties to the dispute shall follow the procedures set forth in the paragraph determined by EPA to be applicable. However, if the Settling Defendants ultimately appeal to the court to resolve the dispute, the Court shall determine which paragraph is applicable in accordance with the standards of applicability set forth in Paragraphs 64 or 65.
- 64. Formal dispute resolution for disputes pertaining to the selection or adequacy of any response action and any other disputes that are accorded review on the administrative record under applicable principles of administrative law shall be conducted pursuant to the procedures set forth in this Paragraph. For purposes of this Paragraph, the adequacy of any response action includes, without limitation: (1) the adequacy or

appropriateness of plans, procedures to implement plans, or any other items requiring approval by EPA under this Consent Decree; and (2) the adequacy of the performance of response actions taken pursuant to this Consent Decree. Nothing in this Consent Decree shall be construed to allow any dispute by Settling Defendants regarding the validity of the ROD's provisions.

NIBW 2ND CONSENT DECREE

- a. An administrative record of the dispute shall be maintained by EPA and shall contain the written notification of such dispute, all statements of position, including supporting documentation, submitted pursuant to this Paragraph. Where appropriate, EPA may allow submission of supplemental documents and/or statements of position by the parties to the dispute.
- b. The Director of the Hazardous Waste Management
  Division, EPA Region 9, will issue a final administrative
  decision resolving the dispute based on the administrative record
  described in Paragraph 64.a. This decision shall be binding upon
  the Settling Defendants, subject only to the right to seek
  judicial review pursuant to Paragraphs 64.c. and d.
- Paragraph 64.b. shall be reviewable by this Court, provided that a notice of judicial appeal is filed by the Settling Defendants with the Court and served on all Parties within 10 days of receipt of EPA's decision. The notice of judicial appeal shall include a description of the matter in dispute, the efforts made by the parties to resolve it, the relief requested, and the schedule, if any, within which the dispute must be resolved to ensure orderly implementation of this Consent Decree. The United

- States may file a response to Settling Defendants' notice of judicial appeal.
- d. In proceedings on any dispute governed by this Paragraph, Settling Defendants shall have the burden of demonstrating that the decision of the Director of the Hazardous Waste Management Division is arbitrary and capricious or otherwise not in accordance with law. Judicial review of EPA's decision shall be on the administrative record compiled pursuant to Paragraph 64.a.
- 65. Formal dispute resolution for disputes that neither pertain to the selection or adequacy of any response action nor are otherwise accorded review on the administrative record under applicable principles of administrative law shall be governed by this Paragraph.
- Following receipt of Settling Defendants' Statement of 15 Position submitted pursuant to Paragraph 63, the Director of the 16 Hazardous Waste Management Division, EPA Region 9, will issue a 17 final decision resolving the dispute. The Hazardous Waste 18 Management Division Director's decision shall be binding on the 19 Settling Defendants unless within 10 days of receipt of the 20 decision, the Settling Defendants file with the Court and serve 21 on the parties a notice of judicial appeal setting forth the 22 matter in dispute, the efforts made by the parties to resolve it, 23 the relief requested, and the schedule, if any, within which the 24 dispute must be resolved to ensure orderly implementation of the 25 Consent Decree. The United States may file a response to 26 Settling Defendants' notice of judicial appeal. 27 I

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

- b. Notwithstanding Paragraph J of Section I (Background) of this Consent Decree, judicial review of any dispute governed by this Paragraph shall be governed by applicable provisions of law.
- of. The invocation of formal dispute resolution procedures under this Section shall not extend, postpone or affect in any way any obligation of the Settling Defendants under this Consent Decree not directly in dispute, unless EPA or the Court agrees otherwise. Stipulated penalties with respect to the disputed matter shall continue to accrue but payment shall be stayed pending resolution of the dispute as provided in Paragraph 74. Notwithstanding the stay of payment, stipulated penalties shall accrue from the first day of noncompliance with any applicable provision of this Consent Decree. In the event that the Settling Defendant does not prevail on the disputed issue, stipulated penalties shall be assessed and paid as provided in Section XXI (Stipulated Penalties).

## XXI. STIPULATED PENALTIES

penalties in the amounts set forth in Paragraph 68.a-d to the United States for failure to comply with the requirements of this Consent Decree specified below, unless excused under Section XIX (Force Majeure). "Compliance" by Settling Defendants shall include completion of the activities under this Consent Decree or any plan approved under this Consent Decree identified below in accordance with all applicable requirements of law, this Consent Decree, the SOWs, and any plans or other documents approved by EPA pursuant to this Consent Decree and within the specified time

schedules established by and approved under this Consent Decree. 1 Settling Defendants shall be jointly and severally liable for any 2 stipulated penalties pursuant to the provisions of this Section 3 with respect to the Joint Work, provided, that the total amount 4 due and payable for each day of each violation shall not exceed 5 those limits specified in this Section. Settling Defendants 6 required to conduct area-specific Vadose Zone Work under this 7 Decree shall be solely responsible (or, where applicable, jointly 8 and severally responsible with other Settling Defendants required 9 to conduct the same area-specific Vadose Zone Work) for 10 11 stipulated penalties assessed with respect to such area-specific Vadose Zone Work. 12 The following stipulated penalties shall be payable 13 per violation per day to the United States for any failure to 14 timely or adequately complete the reports identified in 15 Subparagraph b: 16 17 Penalty Per Violation Period of Noncompliance Per Day 18 First through 14th calendar day 19 \$5,000 **\$7,5**00 ---15th through 30th calendar day 20 31st calendar day and beyond 21 \$20,000 b. For Joint Work: Area A Monitoring Well Installation 22 Summary Report; Area B Monitoring Well Installation Summary 23 Report; Area C Monitoring Well Installation Summary Report; Phase 24 II Proposal for Additional Monitoring Wells. 25

For Vadose Zone Work: Vadose Zone Investigation and Ground-Water Threat Estimate Calculations Report; SVE System 28 Design.

26

The following stipulated penalties shall be payable per violation per day to the United States for any noncompliance with the requirements of this Consent Decree concerning all other reports, plans, data gathering and well installation activities, or for any other violations of this Consent Decree, including but not limited to, all implementation schedules and performance submission dates:

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

7

1

2

3

5

6

Penalty Per Violation Period of Noncompliance Per Day \$1,000 First through 7th calendar day \$3,000 8th through 14th calendar day \$10,000 15th through 30th calendar day \$15,000

31st calendar day and beyond

- In the event that EPA assumes performance of a portion or all of the Joint or Vadose Zone Work pursuant to Paragraph 81 of Section XXII (Covenants Not to Sue by Plaintiffs), Settling Defendants who are responsible for performance of such Joint or area-specific Vadose Zone Work shall be liable for a stipulated penalty equal to the lesser of one million dollars (\$1,000,000.00) or two times the response costs incurred to perform such Joint or area-specific Vadose Zone Work, plus interest.
- Each Cash Defendant shall be liable to the United States for stipulated penalties for (1) failure to grant access in accordance with Section X.26.a (Access); or (2) a violation of Section XXVI (Retention of Records). The Stipulated penalty for any violation under (1) or (2) of the preceding sentence shall be five hundred dollars (\$500) per day. Payments shall be made in

accordance with the procedure set forth in Paragraph 71 of this Consent Decree. The provisions of Section XX (Dispute Resolution) shall apply to any dispute between EPA and Cash Defendant(s) over whether a violation has occurred under (1) or (2) of this Subparagraph.

- 69. All penalties shall begin to accrue on the day after the complete performance is due or the day a violation occurs, and shall continue to accrue through the final day of the correction of the noncompliance or completion of the activity. Nothing herein shall prevent the simultaneous accrual of separate penalties for separate violations of this Consent Decree.
- Following EPA's determination that Settling Defendants have failed to comply with a requirement of this Consent Decree, or that Cash Defendant(s) have failed to comply with a requirement of this Consent Decree as described in Paragraph 68.e, EPA may give Settling or Cash Defendants written notification of the same and describe the noncompliance. EPA may send the Settling or Cash Defendants a written demand for the payment of the penalties. However, penalties shall accrue as provided in the preceding Paragraph regardless of whether EPA has notified the Settling or Cash Defendants of a violation.
- All penalties owed to the United States under this section shall be due and payable within 30 days of the Defendant(s')('s) receipt from EPA of a demand for payment of the penalties, unless Defendant(s) invoke the Dispute Resolution procedures under Section XX (Dispute Resolution). All payments under this Section shall be paid by certified check made payable 28 to "EPA Hazardous Substances Superfund," shall be mailed to U.S.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

- Environmental Protection Agency, Region 9, Superfund Accounting, P.O. Box 360863M, Pittsburgh, PA 15251, and shall reference CERCLA Site Number provided by EPA and DOJ Case Number 90-11-2-413B. Copies of check(s) paid pursuant to this Section, and any accompanying transmittal letter(s), shall be sent to the United States as provided in Section XXVII (Notices and Submissions).
- 72. The payment of penalties shall not alter in any way
  Settling Defendants' obligation to complete the performance of
  the Joint or Vadose Zone Work required under this Consent Decree.
- 73. Penalties shall continue to accrue as provided in Paragraph 70 during any dispute resolution period, but need not be paid until the following:
- a. If the dispute is resolved by agreement or by a decision of EPA that is not appealed to this Court (including any dispute regarding an EPA-assumption-of-work penalty), accrued penalties determined to be owing shall be paid to EPA within 15 days of the agreement or the receipt of EPA's decision or order;
- b. If the dispute is appealed to this Court and the United

  States prevails in whole or in part, Defendant(s) shall pay all

  accrued penalties determined by the Court to be owed to EPA

  within 60 days of receipt of the Court's decision or order,

  except as provided in Subparagraph c below;
- c. If the Court's decision is appealed by any Party,
  Defendant(s) shall pay all accrued penalties determined by the
  Court to be owing to the United States into an interest-bearing
  escrow account within 60 days of receipt of the Court's decision
  or order. Penalties shall be paid into this account as they
  continue to accrue, at least every 60 days. Within 15 days of

receipt of the final appellate court decision, the escrow agent shall pay the balance of the account to EPA or to Defendant(s) to the extent that they(it) prevail(s).

- If Defendant(s) fail to pay stipulated penalties when due, the United States may institute proceedings to collect the penalties, as well as interest. Defendant(s) shall pay interest on the unpaid balance, which shall begin to accrue on the date of demand made pursuant to Paragraph 71 at the rate established pursuant to Section 107(a) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9607.
- The stipulated penalties established in this Consent Decree shall be the exclusive mechanism for the assessment and collection of penalties for noncompliance with the provisions subject to stipulated penalties, unless EPA elects, in lieu of demanding such stipulated penalties, to seek civil penalties under CERCLA.
- No payments made under this Section shall be tax deductible for Federal or State tax purposes.

# XXII. COVENATIS NOS TO SUE BY PLAINTIFF

In consideration of the actions that will be performed and the payments that will be made by the Settling Defendants under the terms of this Consent Decree, and except as specifically provided in Paragraphs 77, 78, and 80 of this Section, the United States covenants not to sue or to take administrative action against Settling Defendants pursuant to Sections 106 and 107(a) of CERCLA, and Section 7003 of RCRA for performance of the Joint or Vadose Zone Work and for recovery of Past Response Costs and Future Response Costs. These covenants 28 not to sue shall take effect upon the receipt by EPA of the

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

payments required by Paragraph 50 of Section XVII (Reimbursement of Response Costs). These covenants not to sue are conditioned upon the complete and satisfactory performance by Settling Defendants of their obligations under this Consent Decree. These covenants not to sue extend only to the Settling Defendants and do not extend to any other person.

b. In consideration of the actions that will be performed and the payments that will be made by the Settling Defendants under the terms of this Consent Decree and under the terms of the SOUCD, the United States covenants not to sue or to take administrative action against Settling Defendants pursuant to Sections 106 and 107(a) of CERCLA, and Section 7003 of RCRA for future liability relating to the Site, except as specifically provided in Paragraphs 77, 78, and 80 and except as specifically provided in Paragraphs C and D of Section XXXI (Covenants Not to Sue and Reservations of Rights) of the SOUCD. These covenants not to sue shall take effect upon Certification of Completion by EPA of Joint Remedial Action and area-specific Vadose Zone Work pursuant to Section XV (Certification of Completion), Paragraph 46 of this Consent Decree and Certification of Completion of Remedial Action pursuant to Section XXXIX (Termination and Satisfaction), Paragraph B of the SOUCD. These covenants not to sue are conditioned upon the complete and satisfactory performance by Settling Defendants of their obligations under this Consent Decree and the SOUCD, including achieving ARARs and other criteria in the MAU and LAU as required in Appendix A of the ROD. These covenants not to sue extend only to the Settling 28 Defendants and do not extend to any other person.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

In consideration of payments made under the terms of Subparagraph 50.b of Section XVII (Reimbursement of Response Costs) and access provided pursuant to Paragraph 26 of Section X (Access) by Cash Defendants, and except as specifically provided in Paragraphs 77, 78 and 80 of this Section, the United States covenants not to sue or take administrative action against Cash Defendants pursuant to Sections 106 and 107(a) of CERCLA, and Section 7003 of RCRA for performance of the Joint and/or Vadose Zone Work and for recovery of Past Response Costs and Future Response Costs. These covenants not to sue shall take effect upon entry of the Consent Decree by the Court. These covenants not to sue are conditioned upon the complete and satisfactory performance by Cash Defendants of their obligations under this Consent Decree. These covenants not to sue extend only to the Cash Defendants as defined in Section IV (Definitions) and do not extend to any other person.

d. In consideration of the payments made under the terms of
Subparagraph 50.b of Section XVII (Reimbursement of Response

Costs) and access provided pursuant to Paragraph 26 of Section X

(Access) by Cash Defendants under the terms of this Consent

Decree, the United States covenants not to sue or to take

administrative action against Cash Defendants pursuant to

Sections 106 and 107(a) of CERCLA, and Section 7003 of RCRA for

future liability relating to the Site, except as specifically

provided in Paragraphs 77, 78, and 80 and except as specifically

provided in Paragraphs C and D of Section XXXI (Covenants Not to

Sue and Reservations of Rights) of the SOUCD. These covenants

not to sue shall take effect upon Certification of Completion by

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

EPA of Joint Remedial Action and area-specific Vadose Zone Work pursuant to Section XV (Certification of Completion), Paragraph 46 of this Consent Decree and Certification of Completion of Remedial Action pursuant to Section XXXIX (Termination and Satisfaction), Paragraph B of the SOUCD. These covenants not to sue are conditioned upon the complete and satisfactory performance by Cash Defendants of their obligations under this Consent Decree. These covenants not to sue extend only to the Cash Defendants and do not extend to any other person.

Notwithstanding any other provision of this Consent Decree, the United States reserves, and this Consent Decree is without prejudice to, the right to institute proceedings in this action or in a new action, or to issue an administrative order seeking to compel Defendants (1) to perform further response actions relating to the Site or (2) to reimburse the United States for additional costs of response if, prior to certification of

completion of the Joint Remedial Action or prior to certification

of the Vadose Zone Work for each specific area:

Plaintiff's Pre-certification reservations.

- (i) conditions at the Site, previously unknown to EPA,are discovered, or
- (ii) information, previously unknown to EPA, is received, in whole or in part,

and these previously unknown conditions or information together with any other relevant information indicates that the Joint Remedial Action or Vadose Zone Work is not protective of human health or the environment.

77.

Plaintiff's Post-certification reservations. 1 Notwithstanding any other provision of this Consent Decree, the 2 United States reserves, and this Consent Decree is without 3 prejudice to, the right to institute proceedings in this action 4 or in a new action, or to issue an administrative order seeking 5 6 to compel Defendants (1) to perform further response actions 7 relating to the Site or (2) to reimburse the United States for additional costs of response if, subsequent to certification of 8 completion of the Joint Remedial Action or the Vadose Zone Work 9 10 for each specific area:

- (i) conditions at the Site, previously unknown to are discovered, or
- (ii)information, previously unknown to EPA, is received, in whole or in part,

and these previously unknown conditions or this information together with other relevant information indicate that the Joint Remedial Action or Vadose Zone Work is not protective of human health or the environment.

79. For purposes of Paragraph 77, the information and the conditions known to EPA shall include only that information and those conditions set forth in the Record of Decision for the Site and the administrative record supporting the Record of Decision. For purposes of Paragraph 78, the information previously received by and the conditions known to EPA shall include only that information and those conditions set forth in the Record of Decision, the administrative record supporting the Record of Decision, and any information received by EPA pursuant to the 28 requirements of this Consent Decree prior to Certification of

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

Completion of the Joint Remedial Action or Vadose Zone Work for each specific area.

- 80. General reservations of rights. The covenants not to sue set forth above do not pertain to any matters other than those expressly specified in Paragraph 76. The United States reserves, and this Consent Decree is without prejudice to, all rights against Defendants with respect to all other matters, including but not limited to, the following:
  - (1) claims based on a failure by Defendants to meet a requirement of this Consent Decree;
  - (2) liability arising from the past, present, or future disposal, release, or threat of release of Waste Materials outside of the Site;
  - (3) liability for damages for injury to, destruction of, or loss of natural resources;
  - (4) liability for response costs that have been or may be incurred by any federal agencies which are trustees for natural resources and which have, or may in the future, spend funds relating to the Site;
    - (5) criminal liability;
  - (6) liability for violations of federal or state law which occur during or after implementation of the Joint Remedial Action or Vadose Zone Work; and
  - (7) liability for costs that the United States will incur related to the Site but are not within the definition of Future Response Costs.
- 81. a. In the event EPA determines that Settling Defendants have failed to implement any provisions of the Joint or Vadose

Zone Work in an adequate or timely manner, EPA may perform any and all portions of the Joint or Vadose Zone Work as EPA determines necessary. Settling Defendants may invoke the procedures set forth in Section XX (Dispute Resolution) to dispute EPA's determination that the Settling Defendants failed to implement a provision of the Joint or Vadose Zone Work in an adequate or timely manner as arbitrary and capricious or otherwise not in accordance with law. Such dispute shall be resolved on the administrative record. Costs incurred by the United States in performing the Joint or Vadose Zone Work pursuant to this Paragraph shall be considered Future Response Costs that Settling Defendants shall pay pursuant to Section XVII (Reimbursement of Response Costs).

b. If EPA determines in the event of an imminent and substantial endangerment related to the Site, that it will take over performance of the Joint Remedial Action or any areaspecific Vadose Zone Work or any portion thereof, to the extent practicable, EPA will provide notice to Settling Defendants and an opportunity to perform any affected portions of the Joint Remedial Action or area-specific Vadose Zone Work. determines that it will take over performance of the Joint Remedial Action or area-specific Vadose Zone Work or any portion thereof under this Paragraph for any reason other than an imminent and substantial endangerment, EPA will provide notice to Settling Defendants regarding their performance of the Joint Remedial Action or area-specific Vadose Zone Work which is prompting EPA to take over such work. EPA will also, after 28 consultation with Settling Defendants, provide Settling

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

- Defendants a schedule setting forth the time within which Settling Defendants shall have the opportunity to cure the deficiency. The provisions of Section XXI (Stipulated Penalties) shall apply to any work performed by Settling Defendants under this Paragraph.
- 82. Notwithstanding any other provision of this Consent
  Decree, the United States retains all authority and reserves all
  rights to take any and all response actions authorized by law.

### XXIII. COVENANTS BY DEFENDANTS

83. Defendants hereby covenant not to sue and agree not to assert any claims or causes of action against the United States with respect to the Site or this Consent Decree, including, but not limited to, any direct or indirect claim for reimbursement from the Hazardous Substance Superfund (established pursuant to the Internal Revenue Code, 26 U.S.C. § 9507) through CERCLA Sections 106(b)(2), 111, 112, 113 or any other provision of law, or any claims arising out of response activities at the Site. However, the Defendants reserve, and this Consent Decree is without prejudice to, actions against the United States based on negligent actions taken directly by the United States (not including oversight or approval of the Settling Defendants plans or activities) that are brought pursuant to any statute other than CERCLA and for which the waiver of sovereign immunity is found in a statute other than CERCLA. Nothing in this Consent Decree shall be deemed to constitute preauthorization of a claim within the meaning of Section 111 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9611, or 40 C.F.R. § 300.700(d).

NIBW 2ND CONSENT DECREE

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

84. Nothing in this Consent Decree shall be construed to

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

hereto.

- create any rights in, or grant any cause of action to, any person not a party to this Consent Decree. The preceding sentence shall not be construed to waive or nullify any rights that any person not a signatory to this Decree may have under applicable law. Each of the Parties expressly reserves any and all rights (including, but not limited to, any right to contribution), defenses, claims, demands, and causes of action which each party may have with respect to any matter, transaction, or occurrence relating in any way to the Site against any person not a party
- With regard to claims for contribution against Defendants for matters addressed in this Consent Decree, the Parties hereto agree that the Defendants are entitled to such protection from contribution actions or claims as is provided by CERCLA Section 113(f)(2), 42 U.S.C. \$ 9613(f)(2).
- 86. The Defendants agree that with respect to any suit or claim for contribution brought by them for matters related to this Consent Decree they will notify the United States in writing no later than 60 days prior to the initiation of such suit or claim.
- The Defendants also agree that with respect to any suit 87. or claim for contribution brought against them for matters related to this Consent Decree they will notify in writing the United States and the State within 20 days of service of the complaint on them. In addition, Defendants shall notify the 28 United States and the State within 20 days of service or receipt

- of any Motion for Summary Judgment and within 20 days of receipt of any order from a court setting a case for trial.
- 88. In any subsequent administrative or judicial proceeding initiated by the United States for injunctive relief, recovery of response costs, or other appropriate relief relating to the Site, Defendants shall not assert, and may not maintain, any defense or claim based upon the principles of waiver, res judicata, collateral estoppel, issue preclusion, claim-splitting, or other defenses based upon any contention that the claims raised by the United States in the subsequent proceeding were or should have been brought in the instant case; provided, however, that nothing in this Paragraph affects the enforceability of the covenants not to sue set forth in Section XXII (Covenants Not to Sue by Plaintiff).

## XXV. ACCESS TO INFORMATION

89. Settling Defendants shall provide to EPA and the State, upon request by EPA, copies of all documents and information within their possession or control or that of their contractors or agents relating to activities at the Site or to the implementation of this Consent Decree, including, but not limited to, sampling, analysis, chain of custody records, manifests, trucking logs, receipts, reports, sample traffic routing, correspondence, or other documents or information related to the Joint or Vadose Zone Work. Settling Defendants shall also make available to EPA and the State, upon request by EPA, for purposes of investigation, information gathering, or testimony, their employees, agents, or representatives with knowledge of relevant

facts concerning the performance of the Joint or Vadose Zone Work.

Settling Defendants may assert business confidentiality claims covering part or all of the documents or information submitted to Plaintiffs under this Consent Decree to the extent permitted by and in accordance with Section 104(e)(7) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. \$ 9604(e)(7), and 40 C.F.R. \$ 2.203(b). Documents or information determined to be confidential by EPA will be afforded the protection specified in 40 C.F.R. Part 2, Subpart B. If no claim of confidentiality accompanies documents or information when they are submitted to EPA and the State, or if EPA has notified Settling Defendants that the documents or information are not confidential under the standards of Section 104(e)(7) of CERCLA, the public may be given access to such documents or information without further notice to Settling Defendants.

b. The Settling Defendants may assert that certain documents, records and other information are privileged under the attorney-client privilege or any other privilege recognized by federal law. If the Settling Defendants assert such a privilege in lieu of providing documents, they shall provide the Plaintiffs with the following: (1) the title of the document, record, or information; (2) the date of the document, record, or information; (3) the name and title of the author of the document, record, or information; (4) the name and title of each addressee and recipient; (5) a description of the contents of the document, record, or information; and (6) the privilege asserted 28 by Settling Defendants. However, no documents, reports or other

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

information created or generated pursuant to the requirements of the Consent Decree shall be withheld on the grounds that they are privileged.

91. No claim of confidentiality shall be made with respect to any data, including, but not limited to, all sampling, analytical, monitoring, hydrogeologic, scientific, chemical, or engineering data, or any other documents or information evidencing conditions at or around the Site.

## XXVI. RETENTION OF RECORDS

92. Until 10 years after the Defendants receipt of EPA's notification pursuant to Paragraphs 46.b or 47.b of Section XV (Certification of Completion) as appropriate for area-specific Vadose Zone Work or Joint Work, each Defendant shall preserve and retain all records and documents now in its possession or control or which come into its possession or control that relate in any manner to the performance of the area-specific Vadose Zone Work or Joint Work respectively, or liability of any person for response actions conducted and to be conducted at the Site, regardless of any corporate retention policy to the contrary. Until 10 years after the Defendants' receipt of EPA's notification pursuant to Paragraphs 46.b or 47.b of Section XV (Certification of Completion) as appropriate for area-specific Vadose Zone Work or Joint Work, Defendants shall also instruct their contractors and agents to preserve all documents, records, and information of whatever kind, nature or description relating to the performance of such work.

At the conclusion of this document retention period, 28 Defendants shall notify the United States at least 90 days prior

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

to the destruction of any such records or documents, and, upon 1 request by the United States Defendants shall deliver any such 2 records or documents to EPA. The Defendants may assert that 3 certain documents, records and other information are privileged 4 under the attorney-client privilege or any other privilege 5 recognized by federal law. If the Defendants assert such a 6 privilege, they shall provide the Plaintiff with the following: 7 (1) the title of the document, record, or information; (2) the 8 date of the document, record, or information; (3) the name and 9 title of the author of the document, record, or information; (4) 10 the name and title of each addressee and recipient; (5) a 11 description of the subject of the document, record, or 12 information; and (6) the privilege asserted by Defendants. 13 However, no documents, reports or other information created or 14 generated pursuant to the requirements of the Consent Decree 15 shall be withheld on the grounds that they are privileged. 16 94. Each Defendant hereby certifies, individually, that it 17 has not altered, mutilated, discarded, destroyed or otherwise 18 disposed of any records, documents or other information relating 19 to its potential liability regarding the Site since notification 20 of potential liability by the United States or the State or the 21 filing of suit against it regarding the Site and that it has 22 fully complied with any and all EPA requests for information 23 pursuant to Section 104(e) and 122(e) of CERCLA and Section 3007 24 of RCRA. 25

26

27

```
95. Whenever, under the terms of this Consent Decree, written
      2
         notice is required to be given or a report or other document is
      3
         required to be sent by one Party to another or to the State, it
      4
         shall be directed to the individuals at the addresses specified
      5
         below, unless those individuals or their successors give notice
      6
      7
         of a change to the other Parties in writing. All notices and
         submissions shall be considered effective upon receipt, unless
      8
      9
         otherwise provided. Written notice as specified herein shall
         constitute complete satisfaction of any written notice
     10
         requirement of the Consent Decree with respect to the United
     11
         States, EPA, the State, and the Defendants, respectively.
     12
     13
         As to the United States:
     14
         Chief, Environmental Enforcement Section
         Environment and Natural Resources Division
         U.S. Department of Justice
                                          For express mail only:
     15
                                              10th & Pennsylvania Aves N.W.
         P.O. Box 7611
                                              Room 1541
         Washington, D.C. 20044-7611
     16
                                              Washington, D.C. 20530
            Re: DJ \neq 90-11-2-413 B
     17
                                              Telefax #: (202) 514-0097
                                              Telephone: (202) 514-4114
     18
                   and
     19
         Daniel Opalski
     20
         EPA Project Coordinator
         United States Environmental Protection Agency
21
         Region 9, H-7-2
         75 Hawthorne Street
     22
         San Francisco, CA
                            94105
                                                Telefax #: (415) 744-1917
                                                Telephone: (415) 744-2359
     23
                                                ADWR:
                            ADEQ:
         As to the State:
     24
                                               Mason Bolitho
         Samir Badri
     25
         NIBW Project Coordinator
                                                Arizona Dept. of Water
         Arizona Dept. Environmental Quality
                                                  Resources
                                                15 South 15th Avenue
         3033 North Central Avenue
     26
                                                Phoenix, AZ 85007
         Phoenix, AZ 85012
     27
                                                Telefax #: (602) 542-1552
         Telefax #: (602) 207-4237
```

NOTICES AND SUBMISSIONS

Telephone: (602) 256-0506

28 Telephone: (602) 207-4236

```
As to the Settling Defendants:
 2
    As to Salt River Project:
   Manager, Environmental Services Department (PAB-352)
 3
    Salt River Project
    1521 North Project Drive (For express mail)
 4
    Tempe, AZ 85281 - or -
    P.O. Box 52025
 5 l
                                          Telefax #: (602) 236-3407
    Phoenix, AZ 85072-2025
 6
                                          Telephone: (602) 236-6699
 7
    As to SmithKline Beecham Corporation:
 8
    Thomas Beggs
    SmithKline Beecham Pharmaceuticals
 9
    709 Swedeland Road
                                (For express mail)
    P.O. Box 1539, L25
    King of Prussia, PA 19406-0939
10
                                          Telefax #: (215) 270-7437
                                          Telephone: (215) 270-7402
11
    As to Siemens Corporation:
12
    Jeffrey H. Marcus
13
    Siemens Components, Inc.
    186 Wood Avenue South
14
    Iselin, NJ 08830
                                          Telefax #: (908) 632-2818
                                          Telephone: (908) 321-8816
15
    As to the City of Scottsdale:
16
    Indian Bend Wash Project Coordination
    Water Resources Department
    9191 E. San Salvador Drive
18
    Scottsdale, AZ 85258
                                          Telefax #: (602) 391-5615
                                          Telephone: (602) 391-5687
19
    As to Motorola Inc.:
20
    Donald Netko
21
    8201 McDowell Road, S140
    Scottsdale, Arizona 85252
                                          Telefax #: (602) 994-6002
22
                                          Telephone: (602) 441-8110
23
    As to the Cash Defendants:
    As to Rolamech:
24
    Duncan Highsmith, President
25
    Chief Executive Officer
26
    The Highsmith Company, Inc.
    P.O. Box 800
   W 5527 Highway 106
27
                                (For express mail)
    Fort Atkinson, Wisconsin 53538-0800 Telefax #: (414) 563-7395
28
                                          Telephone: (414) 563-9571
```

```
1
         As to Microsemi Corp. - Scottsdale:
         Mick McKeighan, Vice-President and General Manager
         Microsemi Corp. - Scottsdale
         8700 East Thomas Road
      3
                                                Telefax #:
         Scottsdale, AZ 85252
                                                            (602) 941-6444
                                                Telephone:
                                                            (602) 941-6300
         As to Scottsdale Memorial Hospital:
      5
         Mary W. Rekate, Esq.
      6
         Scottsdale Memorial Hospital
      7
         7400 East Osborn Road
                                                Telefax #:
         Scottsdale, AZ 85251
                                                            (602) 481-4989
      8
                                                            (602) 481-4000
                                                Telephone:
      9
         As to P.A.G.E.-Layher:
         Dr. Berthold Koester
     10
         General Manager, P.A.G.E. Layher
     11
         4250 East Camelback Road, Suite 120
         Phoenix, AZ 85018-0414
                                                Telefax #:
                                                            (602) 840-0476
     12
                                                Telephone: (602) 840-0414
         As to L.D. Hancock:
     13
     14
         Mr. Billy Haygood
         P.O. Box 2203
     15
         Tupelo, Mississippi 38803
     16
     17
                               XXVIII.
                                        EFFECTIVE DATE
                 The effective date of this Consent Decree shall be the
     18
     19
         date upon which this Consent Decree is entered by the Court,
     20
         except as otherwise provided herein.
                     XXIX. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION
- 21
     22
                 This Court retains jurisdiction over both the subject
     23
         matter of this Consent Decree and the Defendants for the duration
     24
         of the performance of the terms and provisions of this Consent
         Decree for the purpose of enabling any of the Parties to apply to
     25
     26
         the Court at any time for such further order, direction, and
     27
         relief as may be necessary or appropriate for the construction or
```

modification of this Consent Decree, or to effectuate or enforce

compliance with its terms, or to resolve disputes in accordance 1 with Section XX (Dispute Resolution) hereof. 2 XXX. 3 <u>APPENDICES</u> The following appendices are attached to and incorporated 4 into this Consent Decree: 5 6 "Appendix A" is the ROD. 7 "Appendix B.2-B.3, B.5-B.10" are the SOWs for the Vadose Zone Work. 8 9 "Appendix B.11" is the SOW for the Joint Remedial Action. "Appendix C" is the description and/or map of the Site. 10 11 "Appendix D" is Attachment II to EPA's Special Notice Letter 12 dated September 30, 1991. 13 "Appendix E" is the list of Supervising Contractors for Settling Defendants. 14 15 XXXI. COMMUNITY RELATIONS 16 Settling Defendants shall propose to EPA their 17 participation in the community relations plan to be developed by EPA will determine the reasonable and appropriate roles for 18 the Settling Defendants under the Plan. Settling Defendants 19 shall also cooperate with EPA in providing information regarding 20 the Joint or Vadose Zone Work to the public. As requested by 21 EPA, Settling Defendants shall participate in the preparation of 22 such information for dissemination to the public and in public 23 meetings which may be held or sponsored by EPA or the State to 24 25 explain activities at or relating to the Site. 26 XXXII. MODIFICATION 27 Schedules specified in this Consent Decree for

28 completion of the Joint or Vadose Zone Work may be modified by

agreement of EPA and the Settling Defendants. All such 1 modifications shall be made in writing. 101. No material modifications shall be made to the Joint or 3 Vadose Zone Work without written notification to and written approval of the United States, the Settling Defendants, and the Court. Modifications that do not materially alter the Joint or Vadose Zone Work may be made by written agreement between EPA 8 and the Settling Defendants. Nothing in this Decree shall be deemed to alter the 9 Court's power to enforce, supervise or approve modifications to this Consent Decree. 11 XXXIII. LODGING AND OPPORTUNITY FOR PUBLIC COMMENT 12 This Consent Decree shall be lodged with the Court for a 103. period of not less than thirty (30) days for public notice and comment in accordance with Section 122(d)(2) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. 15 § 9622(d)(2), and 28 C.F.R. § 50.7. The United States reserves the right to withdraw or withhold its consent if the comments regarding the Consent Decree disclose facts or considerations which indicate that the Consent Decree is inappropriate, 20 improper, or inadequate. Settling Defendants consent to the entry of this Consent Decree without further notice. If for any reason the Court should decline to approve 22 104. this Consent Decree in the form presented, this agreement is voidable at the sole discretion of any Party and the terms of the agreement may not be used as evidence in any litigation between 25

27 28

2

4

5

7

10

13

14

16

17

18

19

21

23

24

	AAAIV. <u>BIGHRIUAIES/BERVIUE</u>
2	105. Each undersigned representative of a Defendant to this
3	Consent Decree and the Assistant Attorney General for Environment
4	and Natural Resources of the Department of Justice certifies that
5	he or she is fully authorized to enter into the terms and
6	conditions of this Consent Decree and to execute and legally bind
7	such party to this document.
8	106. Each Defendant hereby agrees not to oppose entry of this
9	Consent Decree by this Court or to challenge any provision of
10	this Consent Decree unless the United States has notified the
11	Defendants in writing that it no longer supports entry of the
12	Consent Decree.
13	107. Each Defendant shall identify, on the attached signature
14	page, the name, address and telephone number of an agent who is
15	authorized to accept service of process by mail on behalf of that
16	party with respect to all matters arising under or relating to
17	this Consent Decree. Defendants hereby agree to accept service
18	in that manner and to waive the formal service requirements set
19	forth in Rule 4 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and any
20	applicable local rules of this Court, including, but not limited
-21	to, service of a summons.
22	108. This Consent Decree may be executed and delivered in any
23	number of counterparts, each of which when executed and delivered
24	shall be deemed to be an original, but such counterparts shall
25	together constitute one and the same document.
26	SO ORDERED THIS, DAY OF, 19
27	
28	United States District Judge

		THE UNDERSIGNED PARTIES enter into this Consent Decree in the						
	2 matter of United States v. Motorola, Inc., et al, relating							
	Site.							
	4							
	5		FOR THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA					
	6	Date:	11/23/92	Vieli OMearo				
·	7			Vicki O'Meara Acting Assistant Attorney General				
	8			Environment and Natural Resources Division				
				U.S. Department of Justice				
	9			P.O. Box 7611, Washington, D.C. 20044-7611				
1	0							
1	.1	Date:	10/21/92	Leslie Allen				
1	12			Environmental Enforcement Section Environment and Natural Resources				
1	١3			Division				
1	4			U.S. Department of Justice P.O. Box 7611,	:			
. 1	L 5			Washington, D.C. 20044-7611				
1	۱6			Linda A. Akers United States Attorney				
	7			District of Arizona				
		Date:	Ву:					
1	8			James P. Loss Assistant United States Attorney				
1	l 9			4000 United States Courthouse 230 North First Avenue				
2	20			Phoenix, AZ 85025	Ī			
2	21	Data	8.21.92	John wise				
2	22	Date:	0.21.12	Daniel W. McGovern for				
. 2	23			Regional Administrator, Region IX U.S. Environmental Protection				
2	24		·	Agency, Region IX 75 Hawthorne Street				
	25	-		San Francisco, CA 94105				
		Date:	8/21/92	Who Back				
	26		· '	Martha L. Black Assistant Regional Counsel RC 3-4				
2	27		•	U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region IX				
2	28			75 Hawthorne Street, San Francisco, CA 94105				

	THE UNDERSIGNED PARTY enters into this Consent Decree in									
	2	the matter of United States v. Motorola, Inc., et al.,								
	3	relating to the North Indian Bend Wash Superfund Site.								
	4									
	5	Date: 9-18-92 FOR MICROSEMI CORP SCOTTSDALE,								
	6	AN ARIZONA CORPORATION (FOR ITSELF AND ITS PARENT CORPORATION,								
	7	MICROSEMI CORPORATION)								
,	8	Mario Press								
	9	Philip Frey, President								
	10									
	11	Microsemi Corporation								
	12	Santa Ana, California 92704								
	13	Agent Authorized to Accept Service on Behalf of								
	14	Above-signed Party:								
	15	Mick McKeighan, Vice President and General Manager Microsemi Corp Scottsdale								
	16	8700 East Thomas Road Scottsdale, Arizona 85252								
	17	Telephone Number: (602) 941-6300								
	18									
	19									
	20									
	21									
	22									
	23									
	24									
	25									
	26									
	27									

1	THE UNDERSIGNED PARTY enters into this Consent Decree in the						
2							
3	matter of United States v. Motorola, Inc., et al, relating to						
	the North Indian Bend Wash ("NIBW") Superfund Site.						
4							
5	FOR THE HIGHSMITH COMPANY, INC.						
6	FOR THE HIGHSMITH COMPANY, INC.						
. 7	Date: July 29, 1992 MWW HWASWNH						
8	Duncan Highsmith, President						
9	Chief Executive Officer						
9	The Highsmith Co., Inc. P.O. Box 800						
10	W 5527 Highway 106						
11	Fort Atkinson, WI 53538-0800						
12 13	Agent Authorized to Accept Service on Behalf of Above-signed Party:						
13	Name: Duncan Highsmith						
14	Title: Chief Executive Officer						
15	Address: The Highsmith Co., Inc. P.O. Box 800						
	W 5527 Highway 106						
16	Fort Atkinson, WI 53538-0800 Tel. Number: (414) 563-9571						
17	Fax Number: (414) 563-7395						
<u>=</u> -18 -							
<u> </u>							
19							
20							
21							
22							
23							
دع							

FOR MOTOROLA INC.

Date: 7-29-92 By:

David G.

Vice President and General Manager

8201 East McDowell Road Scottsdale, Arizona 85252

Agent Authorized to Accept Service on Behalf of Above-signed Party:

Name: Catherine B. McKee

Title: Vice President & Director, Environmental & External Affairs Address: 8201 East McDowell Road, H3184, Scottsdale, Arizona 85257

Tel. Number: (602) 441-3065

## FOR L.D. HANCOCK COMPANY

Date: 7/30/92  By: Name: Title: Address:
FOR L.D. HANCOCK, INDIVIDUALLY
Date: -7/30/92 By:
FOR ELAINE HANCOCK, INDIVIDUALLY  Date: 7/2//2 By: 1/2//2 / Flaine Hancock
Agent Authorized to Accent Service on Behalf of Above-signe

Parties:

Name:
Title:
Address:
Tel. Number:

## FOR SIEMENS CORPORATION

Date:	30 July 1942	By:	fruth 6. Com
		_	Walter G. Gans
			★ice President and General Counsel
			/1301 Avenue of the Americas

New York, N.Y. 10019

Date: 3070141992 By:

Adrienne D. Whitehead Secretary & Counsel

Agent Authorized to Accept Service on Behalf of Above-signed Party:

Name: Walter & Gans

Address: 1501 Avenue of the Americas New York, My 10009

Tel. Number: (2/72/ 05% - 44/)

FOR SCOTTSDALE MEMORIAL HOSPITAL

Date: 31 July 1992 By:

Peter Frick, President

Scottsdale Memorial Hospital

7400 East Osborn Road Scottsdale, Arizona 85251

FOR SCOTTSDALE MEMORIAL REALTY CO.

Date: 7-28-92

: Michael C-12 ll

Michael C. Brinkley, President Scottsdale Memorial Realty Co., Inc.

3621 Wells Fargo Avenue Scottsdale, Arizona 85251

Agent Authorized to Accept Service on Behalf of Above-signed Parties:

STK Service Company 2929 North Central Avenue, 14th Floor Phoenix, Arizona 85012-2742

Tel. Number: (602) 279-4900

Title: Address:

Tel. Number: 232-2749

	ALT RIVER VALLEY WATER USERS. ASSOCIATION ALT RIVER PROJECT AGRICULTURAL IMPROVEMENT AND POWER DISTRICT  By  JOHN R. LASSEN  President 1521 Project Drive Tempe, Arizona 85281
William K. O'Neal Secretary	•
APPROVED AS TO FORM:	•
Deborah A. Jamieson Staff Attorney	
Agent Authorized to A	Accept Service on Behalf of Above-signed

> FOR SMITHKLINE BEECHAM CORPORATION ON BEHALF OF ITSELF AND BECKMAN INSTRUMENTS

Date:	august 11, 1992 By:	Multo		
		Albert J. White General Counsel - United States		

Date:	ву:		
		:	

Agent Authorized to Accept Service on Behalf of Above-signed Party:

Name: CT Corp. System
Title: Agent

1635 Market St., Philadelphia, PA 19103 Address:

Tel. Number: (215) 563-7750

FOR THE CITY OF SCOTTSDALE, a municipal corporation

Date:	8-12-92	By:	975. Roll. 10			
			Herbert	R.	Drinkwater,	Mayor

ATTEST:

Soma Rabertson, City Clerk

APPROVED AS TO FORM:

Magaset Wison for Richard W. Garnett III, City Attorney

Agent Authorized to Accept Service on Behalf of Above-signed Party:

Name: Richard W. Garnett III

Title: City Attorney

Address: City of Scottsdale

3939 Civic Center Boulevard Scottsdale, Arizona 85251

Tel. Number: (602) 994-2405

FOR P.A.G.E.-LAYHER

Date:	9-8-92	By: Name: Dr. juris I Title: General I Address: 4250 E Phoenis	Mànager	, Suite 120K
Ag Party	ent Authorized to	o Accept Service	on Behalf of	Above-signed
	Name: Title: Address: Tel. Number:			